

1 STATE OF NEW YORK  
2 MONROE COUNTY GRAND JURY

3 \_\_\_\_\_

4 DAY 5:

5

6 Investigation into the death of Daniel T. Prude

7

8 \_\_\_\_\_

9 Transcript of the Proceedings held before  
10 the Monroe County Grand Jury, at the Monroe County,  
11 Hall of Justice, 99 Exchange Blvd., Rochester, New  
12 York, 14614, on December 16th, 2020.

13

14 APPEARANCES: Letitia James, ESQ.  
15 New York State Attorney General  
16 Appearing for the People  
17 BY: JENNIFER SOMMERS, ESQ.  
18 Deputy Chief of Special Investigations  
19 BY: MICHAEL SMITH, ESQ.  
20 NYS Office of the Attorney General

21

22 REPORTED BY: [REDACTED]  
23 Court Reporter,  
24 FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC  
25 21 Woodcrest Drive,  
Batavia, NY 14020,  
(585) 343-8612

1 I N D E X T O W I T N E S S E S

2 -----

3	FOR THE PEOPLE:	PAGE
4	LT. [REDACTED]	6
5	INV [REDACTED]	20
6	[REDACTED]	27, 120
7	DR. [REDACTED]	54
8	[REDACTED]	126
9	SGT. [REDACTED]	157

10

11

12 I N D E X T O E X H I B I T S

13 FOR THE

14 PEOPLE DESCRIPTION ID EVD

15 -----

16	GJ 45	BWC [REDACTED] 767 W MAIN	14
17	GJ 46	BWC [REDACTED] JEFFERSON	14
18	GJ 47	BWC [REDACTED] JEFFERSON	14
19	GJ 48	BWC [REDACTED] JEFFERSON	14
20	GJ 49	Synchronized BWC videos	23
21	GJ 50	Patient care report	35
22	GJ 51	Still photos	94
23	GJ 51/52	RPD Power Point	170

24

25

1 (Proceeding commenced.)

2 MR. SMITH: Good morning, everybody. We're  
3 back on the record in the investigation into the death  
4 of Daniel Prude. Michael Smith and Jennifer Sommers  
5 present on behalf of the Attorney General's Office.

6 For the record, we do have 21 grand jurors  
7 present this morning and as such, we do have a quorum.

8 I want to start, ladies and gentlemen, the  
9 last time we were here, we heard from the Medical  
10 Examiner -- the Erie County Office of the Medical  
11 Examiner -- I'm sorry. Strike that. The Monroe  
12 County Office of the Medical Examiner, Doctor [REDACTED]  
13 [REDACTED] Doctor [REDACTED] identified Grand Jury Exhibit  
14 36-A, which was for ID as the case summary report, the  
15 autopsy report, and the lab report that pertain to the  
16 autopsy of Daniel Prude that she conducted under case  
17 number 20-00902.

18 I would note, for the record, that Grand  
19 Jury Exhibit 36-A for ID bears a certification from  
20 Doctor [REDACTED] and notarized by [REDACTED]. As  
21 such, at this time, we're going to offer Grand Jury  
22 36-A pursuant to CPL 180.60 and 190.30 in evidence.

23 **(Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 36-A was then**  
24 **received into evidence.)**

25 MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, you are

1 free to review Grand Jury 36-A now that it is in  
2 evidence.

3 I would note, ladies and gentlemen, during  
4 Doctor ██████████ testimony, or following her  
5 testimony, a question came up regarding the collection  
6 time of the sample from Mr. Prude that was tested at  
7 the lab that was the basis for the toxicology report  
8 that Doctor ██████████ talked about. I would note that  
9 the lab report is contained within Grand Jury 36-A and  
10 I would direct the grand jurors' attention to the  
11 specimens received at the bottom of the first page of  
12 that lab report to the collection time of 4:01 a.m. on  
13 March 23rd, 2020.

14 Ladies and gentlemen, I would also note,  
15 just for scheduling purposes, that we anticipate  
16 calling six witnesses today. Ideally, in a perfect  
17 world, ladies and gentlemen, we would have gotten all  
18 the witnesses that we intended to call this week  
19 today, gotten everybody out of the way. I know  
20 there's snow coming that may be of concerns. But, due  
21 to some issues with the availability of a witness, one  
22 of whom is testifying electronically tomorrow, we are  
23 going to bring you back tomorrow for three witnesses.  
24 Hopefully, it will be a shorter day, a half day.

25 So, I want to make everyone aware of that.

1 But, unfortunately, we are going to have to come back  
2 tomorrow for those reasons. So, unless anybody has  
3 any questions about that, with that, we're going to  
4 call Lieutenant [REDACTED]

5 MS. SOMMERS: Can I just add one thing?  
6 That in light of the fact that tomorrow's a little bit  
7 of a shorter day, I want to address the fact, I think,  
8 previously, you've been presented with a lot of stuff  
9 and previously we had, kind of, talked about maybe  
10 reviewing some of the evidence if you wanted, if that  
11 would be helpful. So, perhaps, tomorrow, if there's  
12 some evidence that you would like to, sort of, look  
13 at, listen to again, that might be an opportunity.  
14 There might be an opportunity for that. It could also  
15 happen another time. I just wanted to put that out  
16 there. I'm sorry. Go ahead.

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1                   (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
2 Jury room at a time of 9:32 a.m.)

3

4

**L T.** [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

5 after being duly called and sworn, testified as  
6 follows:

7

8

**EXAMINATION BY MR. SMITH:**

9

Q. Good morning, sir?

10

A. Good morning.

11

Q. Could you state and spell your first and last  
12 names for the record?

13

A. My name is [REDACTED]. And, my last name  
14 is spelled [REDACTED].

15

Q. How are you employed, sir?

16

A. I'm employed by the City of Rochester Police  
17 Department.

18

Q. What's your current rank?

19

A. Lieutenant.

20

Q. How long have you been with the Rochester Police  
21 Department in total?

22

A. Working on my 25th year.

23

Q. How long as a Lieutenant, sir?

24

A. I think I'm about eight years in grade.

25

Q. And, can you describe the -- what is your current

1 assignment?

2 A. Currently, I'm assigned as the Major Crimes  
3 Lieutenant in the Central Investigation Section.

4 Q. Lieutenant, when it comes to the Buffalo Police  
5 Department, did you have special duties -- I'm sorry,  
6 the Rochester Police Department. When it comes to the  
7 Rochester Police Department, do you have any special  
8 duties, sir, over the Rochester Body Worn Camera  
9 Program?

10 A. Yes. I'm the highest ranking member that  
11 administers that program.

12 Q. Can you just generally describe for the Grand  
13 Jury how the Rochester Body Worn Camera Program works?

14 A. Sure. Each officer is assigned a body worn  
15 camera, their own camera. They have to affix it to  
16 the outside of their uniform before they start a  
17 shift. During their shift, anything in which they're  
18 going to take some type of police action, they're  
19 required to hit the record button and record that  
20 event. Once it's over, they can stop the recording.  
21 At the end of the night, when they're done with all  
22 those events and all those files, they take the camera  
23 off of their body, they put it into a docking station  
24 which, essentially, is a wholly contained computer.  
25 The computer then takes the files off of that camera,

1 then uploads them to a secured server, where they can  
2 be accessed using body worn camera software.

3 Q. Lieutenant [REDACTED] do individual officers  
4 operate the cameras themselves, turn them on and off  
5 manually?

6 A. Yeah, all cameras are manual, yes.

7 Q. How are those body worn camera videos stored to  
8 the secured server?

9 A. Well --

10 Q. Is there a way that they're identified, was my  
11 question, Lieutenant [REDACTED] Is there a way  
12 they're identified?

13 A. Yeah. Each file -- so, each camera is associated  
14 with some type of identifying factor with the officer,  
15 either an employee ID number or what we call an IBM  
16 number from many years ago that's unique to that  
17 officer. And then, all the files that that officer  
18 takes are filed under his name in order of date.

19 Q. Lieutenant [REDACTED] can the individual officers  
20 -- are they able in any way to change or alter what's  
21 stored on their body worn camera?

22 A. No. The camera is fully contained. They can't  
23 get to the battery. They can't get to the SD card.  
24 Short of the camera falling and getting destroyed in  
25 some way, there's no way to alter any files that are

1 on there.

2 Q. Lieutenant [REDACTED] is anybody in the Rochester  
3 Police Department able to alter those videos ones that  
4 are on the secured server?

5 A. Yeah. We do have people that can alter them.  
6 However, alterations to any videos, in terms of  
7 enhancements that we're looking for, sometimes we'll  
8 take multiple sources of a video and, kind of, put it  
9 together in a story board, so to speak. That's done  
10 by our digital media specialist. However, all those  
11 changes are a copy of the original file. So, the  
12 original file is never changed, only copies of that  
13 original file.

14 Q. And, when those enhancements are done and labels  
15 are placed on, is the actual content of the video  
16 changed in any way, Lieutenant [REDACTED]

17 A. No, the content's not changed, no.

18 Q. I'm going to ask you some questions about the  
19 Daniel Prude investigation, sir. As part of that  
20 investigation, did you retrieve some body worn camera  
21 videos from the secured server?

22 A. Yes, I did.

23 Q. And, Lieutenant [REDACTED] are MCU investigations  
24 in the Rochester Police Department assigned CR number?

25 A. Yes. Essentially, every police call for service

1 that we go to is assigned a crime report number.

2 Q. And, are these body worn camera videos, once  
3 they're uploaded to the secured server, are they  
4 stored according to that CR number?

5 A. Yes. According -- well, they're labeled --  
6 there's, basically, three pieces of information that's  
7 on each file. It's a crime report number, an address  
8 and usually a classification tag in terms of what type  
9 of call that file pertains to.

10 Q. And, in this case, was there a crime report  
11 number 2020-00061280 assigned to this investigation,  
12 the death of Daniel Prude?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. And, did you access and retrieve the body worn  
15 camera videos pursuant to that CR number?

16 A. Yes, sir.

17 Q. And, did that -- did those body worn camera  
18 videos, sir, relate to the scene at 435 Jefferson  
19 Avenue, some of them?

20 A. There were a few addresses all associated with  
21 the 435 Jefferson event and the body worn camera  
22 video, to the best of my memory, was all -- any  
23 address associated with that event was all filed under  
24 that crime report number.

25 Q. And, was some of that body worn video from

1 Officer [REDACTED]

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 Q. Was some of it from Officer [REDACTED]

4 A. Yes, sir.

5 Q. And, was there also a body worn camera video from  
6 Officer [REDACTED]?

7 A. Yes, sir.

8 Q. Lieutenant [REDACTED] I'm showing you what's been  
9 marked as Grand Jury Exhibits 45 through 48 in order  
10 and starting first with Grand Jury Exhibit 45. I'm  
11 going to ask if you recognize what that is, sir?

12 A. Yes. This is the [REDACTED] body worn camera  
13 video from the burglary portion of this at 767 West  
14 Main Street.

15 Q. How do you know that, sir?

16 A. Well, my initials are on it, I see it's got the  
17 address on it and I also identify [REDACTED] ID  
18 number.

19 Q. Did you place those initials and date on it after  
20 you reviewed it, sir?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Is this an accurate copy of the video stored on  
23 the secured server under that CR number?

24 A. Yes, sir.

25 Q. Sir, I'm going to ask you the same questions

1 about Grand Jury Exhibit Number 46, do you recognize  
2 that Exhibit?

3 A. Yes, sir.

4 Q. What do you recognize that Exhibit to be?

5 A. This is the body worn camera video from 435  
6 Jefferson Avenue from [REDACTED].

7 Q. How do you recognize it to be that, sir?

8 A. It's marked with Jefferson Avenue, it has his  
9 identification number on it and I also initialed and  
10 dated it when I reviewed it.

11 Q. So, you reviewed that Exhibit, sir?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. Again, this is an accurate copy of the body worn  
14 camera video from [REDACTED] from the scene at  
15 Jefferson Avenue that you retrieved from the secured  
16 server pursuant to that CR number?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. Same question about Grand Jury Exhibit 47, sir.  
19 Do you recognize that Exhibit?

20 A. Yes, sir.

21 Q. What do you recognize that Exhibit to be?

22 A. This is the body worn camera video from [REDACTED]  
23 [REDACTED] at Jefferson Avenue.

24 Q. And, how do you recognize as such, sir?

25 A. Well, it has [REDACTED] number on it, I also

1 recognize parts of his identification number marked on  
2 it, and I also have my initials and date when I  
3 reviewed it.

4 Q. So, you reviewed this Exhibit, sir?

5 A. Yes, sir.

6 Q. And, this is an exact copy of the body worn  
7 camera that was stored on that secured server for  
8 Officer [REDACTED]?

9 A. Yes, sir.

10 Q. And, finally, sir, I'm going to ask you the same  
11 question about Grand Jury Exhibit 48. Do you  
12 recognize that Exhibit, sir?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. What do you recognize that to be?

15 A. Well, this is the body worn camera video from  
16 Officer [REDACTED] from Jefferson Avenue.

17 Q. How do you recognize that to be that?

18 A. Well, I see his name on the envelope. I also see  
19 his ID number. Although, it's not marked with  
20 Jefferson Avenue, I believe, if I'm correct, he only  
21 had a body camera video from Jefferson Avenue. I also  
22 have my initials on it and the date that I reviewed  
23 it.

24 Q. And, you reviewed this, sir?

25 A. Yes, sir.

1 Q. And, this is an accurate copy of -- exact copy,  
2 rather, of the body worn camera video from Officer  
3 [REDACTED] from the scene at Jefferson Avenue  
4 that you retrieved from that secured system by that CR  
5 number?

6 A. Yes, sir.

7 MR. SMITH: Thank you. At this time, I'm  
8 going to offer Grand Jury Exhibits 45 through 48.

9 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibits 45 through  
10 48 were then received into evidence.)

11 BY MR. SMITH:

12 Q. Finally, Lieutenant [REDACTED] were you present,  
13 sir, at the scene of the incident where Mr. Prude was  
14 restrained that is the subject of this Grand Jury  
15 investigation in the early morning hours of March 23rd  
16 of 2020, around 3:00 o'clock to 3:30 a.m.?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. You were present?

19 A. I was present at the scene after the incident was  
20 completed.

21 Q. My question, sir, was if you were at the scene  
22 during the restraint?

23 A. No, sir. I was not.

24 MR. SMITH: Thank you. Do any of the grand  
25 jurors have any questions for Lieutenant [REDACTED]

1 GRAND JURY POOL: (All jurors indicating a  
2 negative response.)

3 MR. SMITH: Seeing as there are none, you  
4 are excused.

5 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

6 (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
7 room at a time of 9:43 a.m.)

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, at this  
2 time, we are going to play Grand Jury Exhibits 45  
3 through 48 one at a time, starting with Grand Jury  
4 Exhibit 45, which was identified by Lieutenant  
5 [REDACTED] as the body worn camera video from Officer  
6 [REDACTED] from the scene of the burglary at 767 West  
7 Main Street.

8 MS. SOMMERS: It doesn't appear to be  
9 showing on my computer yet.

10 Okay. Everybody good, or do you want the  
11 lights up?

12 MR. SMITH: Do you guys like the lights like  
13 this or on?

14 GRAND JURY POOL: (All jurors indicating a  
15 positive response.)

16 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. For the record then,  
17 we're going to start playing.

18 MR. SMITH: Playing Grand Jury Exhibit 45,  
19 start to finish.

20 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 45, body worn  
21 camera video was then played for the Grand Jury.)

22 MR. SMITH: Which officer is this?

23 MS. SOMMERS: I want to -- for the record,  
24 it is -- for the record, I'm going to stop that. I  
25 accidentally put in Grand Jury Exhibit 46. I'm going

1 to take that out and put in Grand Jury Exhibit 45.  
2 Just so we can go in order.

3 MR. SMITH: Yes.

4 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 46 was  
5 removed and Grand Jury Exhibit 45 was then played for  
6 the Grand Jury.)

7 A JUROR: There's two for [REDACTED]

8 MR. SMITH: Yeah. Just so we're clear here,  
9 before we start, ladies and gentlemen, Exhibit 45, we  
10 inadvertently started playing 46. 45 is what we  
11 intend to play first. We're going to go in order.  
12 Exhibit 45 is identified by Lieutenant [REDACTED] as  
13 Officer [REDACTED] body worn camera video from the  
14 scene of the burglary at 767 West Main Street.

15 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. Sorry about that.

16 MR. SMITH: That's okay. Playing 45 now.

17 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 45, body worn  
18 camera video, was then play for the Grand Jury.)

19 (Whereupon, the video terminated.)

20 MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, that  
21 concludes Grand Jury Exhibit 45. We are now going to  
22 play Grand Jury Exhibit 46 identified by Lieutenant  
23 [REDACTED] as Officer [REDACTED] [REDACTED] body worn camera  
24 video from the scene of the restraint of Mr. Prude at  
25 Jefferson Avenue.

1           (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 46, body worn  
2 camera video, was then played for the Grand Jury.)

3           (Whereupon, the video terminated.)

4           MR. SMITH: That concludes Grand Jury  
5 Exhibit 46. Ladies and gentlemen, at this time, we're  
6 going to play Grand Jury Exhibit 47 identified by  
7 Lieutenant [REDACTED] as the body worn camera video of  
8 Officer [REDACTED] [REDACTED] from the scene at Jefferson  
9 Avenue.

10           MS. SOMMERS: Is the volume okay? Once it  
11 kicks in can everyone in the back hear?

12           GRAND JURY POOL: (All jurors indicating a  
13 positive response.)

14           MS. SOMMERS: Okay.

15           (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 47, body worn  
16 camera video was played for the Grand Jury.)

17           MS. SOMMERS: I apologize.

18           MS. SMITH: For the record, ladies and  
19 gentlemen, that was 48 inadvertently played instead of  
20 47. So, now, we are going to play 47.

21           Again, 47 being the body worn camera video  
22 of Officer [REDACTED]

23           (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 47, body worn  
24 camera was then played for the Grand Jury.)

25           MS. SOMMERS: Pause. For the record, we're

1 restarting the Exhibit.

2 (Whereupon, the video continued to play for  
3 the Grand Jury.)

4 (Whereupon, the video terminated.)

5 MR. SMITH: That concludes Grand Jury  
6 Exhibit 47. And, finally, ladies and gentlemen, we're  
7 going to play Grand Jury Exhibit 48, identified by  
8 Lieutenant [REDACTED] as Officer [REDACTED] body worn  
9 camera video from the scene on Jefferson Avenue.

10 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 48, body worn  
11 camera video was play for the Grand Jury.)

12 (Whereupon, the video terminated.)

13 MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, that  
14 concludes Grand Jury Exhibit 48.

15 And again, I remind the grand jurors that  
16 Exhibits 45 through 45 -- sorry, 45 through 48 are in  
17 evidence and are available for your review.

18 (Whereupon, there was a short break off the  
19 record.)

20 (Proceeding reconvened.)

21 MR. SMITH: At this time, we call [REDACTED]

22 [REDACTED].

23

24

25

1                   (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
2 Jury room at a time of 10:34 a.m.)

3

4                   [REDACTED] [REDACTED] after being duly  
5 called and sworn, testified as follows:

6

7

**EXAMINATION BY MR. SMITH:**

8 Q. Good morning, sir?

9 A. Good morning.

10 Q. Could you state and spell your first and last  
11 names for the record, please?

12 A. [REDACTED]

13 Q. Investigator [REDACTED] remind the grand jurors of  
14 your employment, sir?

15 A. Right now, I work for the Attorney General's  
16 Office, Special Operations Unit.

17 Q. Investigator [REDACTED] you testified previously in  
18 this matter for this Grand Jury regarding some  
19 synchronization of some videos, is that correct?

20 A. Correct.

21 Q. And, since that time, Investigator [REDACTED] have  
22 you discussed this case with any other witnesses?

23 A. No.

24 Q. And, sir, as part of your duties as a Supervisor  
25 in the Special Operations Unit, does that include

1 video and audio processing in evidence?

2 A. It does.

3 Q. And, as part of that work, were you asked to do,  
4 again, additional video synchronizations as part of  
5 this case in the investigation into the death of  
6 Daniel Prude?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And, Investigator [REDACTED] were you asked to  
9 synchronize the body worn camera videos from the  
10 officers at a scene as it pertains to the  
11 investigation?

12 A. Can you repeat that question?

13 Q. The videos that you were asked to create, that  
14 you're testifying to at this time, was that video from  
15 body worn cameras from the police officers that were  
16 at the scene of the restraint of Mr. Prude?

17 A. Yes, sir.

18 Q. On March 23rd?

19 A. Yes, sir.

20 Q. Okay. And, do those body worn cameras, sir,  
21 include the body worn camera videos from Officer [REDACTED]

22 [REDACTED]

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. [REDACTED]?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED]

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Officer [REDACTED]

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. And, Officer [REDACTED]?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Showing you what's been marked as Grand Jury  
8 Exhibit 49, do you recognize that Exhibit?

9 A. I do.

10 Q. What do you recognize that Exhibit to be?

11 A. This is a copy of the five camera views from the  
12 body cameras that you just mentioned that I actually  
13 compiled. My initials are on it and the date that I  
14 made it.

15 Q. And, Grand Jury Exhibit 49, Investigator [REDACTED]  
16 this is the synchronized video that you made from the  
17 five body worn camera videos that we just discussed?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And, you reviewed it and initialed it after you  
20 reviewed that Exhibit?

21 A. True.

22 Q. Is this a copy of the video you created?

23 A. Yes.

24 MR. SMITH: At this time, I'm going to offer  
25 Grand Jury Exhibit 49 into evidence.

1                   (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 49 was then  
2 received into evidence.)

3 BY MR. SMITH:

4 Q.   Now, specifically, Investigator [REDACTED] what did  
5 you do with the five videos that you were given?

6 A.   Well, I took each one separately. I think I took  
7 off the -- a little bit of the leader, once the camera  
8 started when the officer was in the car, so they  
9 started once the officers arrived on scene or just  
10 before. I then added the name of the officer on each  
11 video. I then synced each video by time using the  
12 audio files. And then, displayed them on the screen  
13 in a manner where, when the first camera came on view,  
14 it occupied the whole screen. As a second camera came  
15 up, I made it small and moved it to the left, added a  
16 second camera, and then moved those around on the  
17 screen, up to five cameras. And, as the officers  
18 turned the body cameras off, I again, opened it up.

19 Q.   So, Investigator [REDACTED] is it possible then, on  
20 this video, to view all five body worn cameras at the  
21 same time while they are all on?

22 A.   Yes, that was the purpose.

23 Q.   Sir, is the audio also synced?

24 A.   Yes.

25 Q.   And, other than adding the name plates of the

1 officers and cutting off a little of the beginning of  
2 the transport, or of the trip in the vehicle, sir, did  
3 you alter that footage in any other way?

4 A. No, sir.

5 MR. SMITH: At this time ladies and  
6 gentlemen, we're going to play Grand Jury Exhibit 49.  
7 And, I would state for the record, that the five  
8 videos that Investigator [REDACTED] created this video from  
9 are in evidence before this Grand Jury as Exhibits 41,  
10 44, 46, 47 and 48. And, at this time, we're going to  
11 play 49.

12 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 49 then  
13 played for the Grand Jury.)

14 MR. SMITH: Actually, ladies and gentlemen,  
15 we're going to pause for just two minutes while we  
16 address some technical issues here.

17 MS. SOMMERS: How about five minutes?

18 MR. SMITH: Let's take a five minute break.

19 MS. SOMMERS: Sorry everyone.

20 (Whereupon, there was a short break off the  
21 record.)

22 (Proceeding reconvened.)

23 MR. SMITH: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, I  
24 believe we do have all 21 grand jurors back in the  
25 room. It appears we have fixed the technical issue

1 regarding Grand Jury Exhibit 49. So, at this time,  
2 we're going to play that Exhibit again.

3 (Whereupon, the video played for the Grand  
4 Jury.)

5 (Whereupon, the video was experiencing  
6 technical issues.)

7 THE WITNESS: It's having a problem moving  
8 data from the external drive.

9 (Whereupon, the video continued to play for  
10 the grand jury.)

11 (Whereupon, the video terminated.)

12 Mr. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, that  
13 concludes Grand Jury Exhibit 49.

14 I have no further questions for Investigator  
15 [REDACTED] Do any of the grand jurors have any questions?

16 GRAND JURY POOL: (All jurors indicating a  
17 negative response.)

18 MR. SMITH: Seeing as there are none, you  
19 are excused, sir. Thank you.

20 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

21 (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
22 room at a time of 11:01 a.m.)

23

24

25

1           MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, at this  
2 time, we can take a brief five minute break. Thank  
3 you.

4           (Whereupon, there was a short break off the  
5 record.)

6           (Proceeding reconvened.)

7           MS. SOMMERS: Everyone is back. So, just a  
8 little bit of housekeeping. We'll have a hard stop at  
9 11:45 to get ready for a witness who is testifying  
10 virtually. So, if we get through this witness, great.  
11 I don't want anyone to feel like they didn't get to  
12 ask questions or anything, so if we don't get through  
13 this witness -- this witness, she will stay. But,  
14 we're going to -- we have another witness that we have  
15 to take at 11:45. Well, actually, we're going to test  
16 some equipment at 11:45.

17           A JUROR: Cross our fingers.

18           MS. SOMMERS: Right. You can see how  
19 talented we are.

20           Okay. At this time, we would like to call

21

22

23

24

25

1                   (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
2 Jury room at a time of 11:13 a.m.)

3

4                   [REDACTED]           [REDACTED] after being duly  
5 called and sworn, testified as follows:

6

7

**EXAMINATION BY MS. SOMMERS:**

8           Q.    Good morning.  So, just try to keep your voice up  
9           or just make sure you're in the direction of the  
10           microphone.  Could you please state your name and  
11           spell it as well?

12

A.   [REDACTED]

13

Q.   Where do you work?

14

A.   AMR, Rochester.

15

Q.   Can you tell the Grand Jury what AMR stands for?

16

A.   American Medical Response.

17

Q.   And, what -- what is AMR?

18

A.   AMR is the company that currently has the city  
19 contract to provide the emergency medical services for  
20 the City of Rochester.

21

Q.   So I'm going to ask you to slow down a tiny bit,  
22 because the woman in front of you has to take all of  
23 your words down.  What is your current -- I'd like to  
24 withdraw that.  In what capacity do you work for AMR  
25 currently?

1 A. I am currently a Paramedic.

2 Q. Can you explain for the Grand Jury what a  
3 Paramedic is?

4 A. A Paramedic is the advanced level of care above  
5 an EMT basic. It requires two years of schooling. We  
6 are trained to provide advanced life support,  
7 including, you know, intubation care and cardiac  
8 arrest, interpretation of EKGs and things along those  
9 lines.

10 Q. Are you current on your certifications?

11 A. I am.

12 Q. Before becoming a Paramedic, what level of care  
13 were you? Did you start with something less than  
14 that?

15 A. I started as an EMT basic.

16 Q. What is an EMT basic?

17 A. So, it's the entry level of care for EMS. It is  
18 basic life support, so splinting, a couple of  
19 medications, CPR and AED use.

20 Q. What does AED stand for?

21 A. Automated external defibrillator.

22 Q. Is that when people see patches put on  
23 individuals' bodies, is that an AED?

24 A. Correct. When you're, like, out in public,  
25 they're the ones you walk past in the boxes are AED.

1 Q. All right. Can you please tell the Grand Jury,  
2 where did you work before AMR?

3 A. My very first EMS position was at a first  
4 response agency, SUNY First Responders on Geneseo's  
5 Campus. I then volunteered with the Geneseo Fire  
6 Department, Avon Ambulance, and then CHS Mobile  
7 Integrated Health Care.

8 Q. Where is that located?

9 A. It serves Chili, Henrietta, Scottsville and a  
10 couple of other towns.

11 Q. Were you a Paramedic at those --

12 A. I was not.

13 Q. -- entities?

14 A. No, I was not.

15 Q. Is AMR the first company where you have actually  
16 been working as a Paramedic?

17 A. Full time, yes. At Avon Ambulance I was a  
18 Paramedic for about six months before I left.

19 Q. Thank you. In your capacity -- I'd like to  
20 withdraw that. EMTs and Paramedics and individuals  
21 involved in ambulance type responses, is that commonly  
22 referred to as pre-hospital care?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Thank you. In your capacity as an individual  
25 involved in providing pre-hospital care, have you ever

1 heard of the term excited delirium?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. When was it that you first heard or learned of  
4 that?

5 A. In class. Initially, as an EMT basic, and then  
6 more extensively so in paramedic school.

7 Q. Have you ever also, or have you ever, in addition  
8 to your Paramedic school or EMT class, had the  
9 occasion to watch training videos or anything of that  
10 sort?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Any of them deal with the term excited delirium?

13 A. Yes, there's a regional training video that goes  
14 through excited delirium.

15 Q. And, have you also seen that?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. Is this, what I've just phrased, excited  
18 delirium, something well known in the pre-hospital  
19 care universe?

20 A. Fairly.

21 Q. Okay. What about the Paramedics?

22 A. It's well known enough that we were taught how to  
23 identify it.

24 Q. Okay. And, just -- have you ever been taught how  
25 to recognize it?

1 A. Yes.

2 MS. SOMMERS: So, I'm just going to caution  
3 the Grand Jury. Technically, what the witness was  
4 told or taught is hearsay, but it goes to this  
5 witness' state of mind as to what she was perceiving  
6 and aware of or becoming aware of on the date and time  
7 of question -- in question.

8 BY MS. SOMMERS:

9 Q. So, what have you learned or been trained are,  
10 sort of, the hallmarks or symptoms associated with  
11 excited delirium?

12 A. So, in these patients, we typically see, if we're  
13 able, a very high heart rate. They have very rapid,  
14 quick breaths, typically, very deep breaths. They  
15 very commonly appear stronger than they should be.  
16 They don't react to pain like you would expect them  
17 to. They may not appear to be feeling pain at all.  
18 Very often, we find that they are either partially  
19 clothed or entirely naked. It's believed that they  
20 have a high body temperature, which causes them to  
21 strip down. They very often are very sweaty. They  
22 ramble, and you can try to talk to them and, if you  
23 can understand what they're saying, it doesn't often  
24 make sense, or it's just groans, moans, screams,  
25 things along those lines.

1 Q. If you are dealing with an individual who appears  
2 to fit that description that you just discussed, does  
3 AMR have any type of a protocol that should be used?

4 A. The region has a protocol. AMR does not,  
5 specifically.

6 Q. What is the practice at AMR relative to what  
7 should be done in the field with individuals  
8 expressing these types of symptoms?

9 A. So, to follow the regional protocol, which our  
10 goal is with care, to try to keep the patient from  
11 injuring themselves or anybody else and getting them  
12 safely restrained, whether through medication or  
13 physical restraint.

14 Q. Okay. What types of chemical restraints are  
15 available to a Paramedic, such as you at AMR?

16 A. At AMR me, personally, I only carry Midazolam,  
17 also known as Versed.

18 Q. I'm just going to ask you to slow down a tiny  
19 bit. You only carry what?

20 A. Midazolam.

21 Q. Also known as?

22 A. Versed.

23 Q. Okay. Is that a sedative type drug?

24 A. It is. It's a benzodiazepine.

25 Q. Okay. And, are you authorized to administer

1 that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. What other sedative is provided in the field  
4 through AMR?

5 A. Our Supervisors carry ketamine.

6 Q. And, what is ketamine?

7 A. Ketamine is another sedative. It's in a  
8 different drug class.

9 Q. Are you authorized to carry ketamine?

10 A. In the region, yes. AMR has a separate policy  
11 that prevents me from carrying it.

12 Q. Are you authorized to administer it once it's  
13 provided on the scene?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What's the difference between versed and  
16 ketamine; when would you use one versus another?

17 A. The biggest difference is versed, is known to  
18 have some effects on your blood pressure and on your  
19 respiratory drive, so how fast and how deeply you're  
20 breathing and ketamine does not.

21 Q. When it comes to excited delirium, is there a  
22 mandatory preference for one over the other?

23 A. It's not mandatory. If it's available, ketamine  
24 is the first choice.

25 Q. Okay. Based upon your knowledge of excited

1 delirium, just based on what's framed in your  
2 knowledge base, how is a -- an individual experiencing  
3 excited delirium most likely to die, based on what  
4 you've learned?

5 A. So, we're taught that these patients become very  
6 acidotic. So, the level of acids in their body is  
7 very high due to metabolic reasons. They, as a  
8 result, have the very high respiratory rate to try to  
9 compensate for that. They're vulnerable to cardiac  
10 arrest if that gets hindered in any way. Whether it  
11 being they have an underlying lung disease, or they're  
12 in a position where they can't take the deep rapid  
13 breaths, or medications that slows their respiratory  
14 rate.

15 Q. Okay. So, I just want to be clear. Is it your  
16 understanding, based on what you've learned, that  
17 cardiac arrest would be the end result?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Based on what you just said, the acidotic nature?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Okay. I'd like to show you what's been marked  
22 for identification, Grand Jury Exhibit Number 50. Do  
23 you recognize that?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And, what is that?

1 A. That is my patient care report.

2 Q. Is that the patient care report that deals with  
3 the call you took on March 23rd, 2020?

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. What is a patient care report?

6 A. That is the documentation that we use to, you  
7 know, keep track of everything that was done,  
8 medications, treatments, and any information that we  
9 have regarding the patient's history, what happened,  
10 and what the result was.

11 Q. Okay. Are documents, such as Grand Jury Exhibit  
12 Number 50, made in the normal course of business of  
13 AMR.

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Are the entries on this document made at or about  
16 the time the incident is occurring or shortly  
17 thereafter?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And, are these pre-hospital care reports kept in  
20 the normal course of business of AMR?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Thank you.

23 MS. SOMMERS: I will offer 50, please.

24 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit Number 50 was  
25 then received into evidence.)

1 BY MS. SOMMERS:

2 Q. So, if -- if you need to refer to it, it's in  
3 evidence now, so you can look at it. What was your  
4 shift on -- on March 23rd?

5 A. I don't remember my exact hours at that point but  
6 it was overnight in some capacity.

7 Q. So, at about 3:00 o'clock in the morning, were  
8 you starting, or ending or in the middle of your  
9 shift?

10 A. That would have been close to the end of my  
11 shift.

12 Q. Who was your partner?

13 A. [REDACTED]

14 Q. What level of care provision -- what level of  
15 care provider is [REDACTED]

16 A. [REDACTED] an EMT basic.

17 Q. So, if I understood what you said previously,  
18 that is below the level of care of a Paramedic?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. All right. What was -- I'd like to withdraw  
21 that. Were you assigned to a particular ambulance?

22 A. We were.

23 Q. Where were you originally, when you began to get  
24 the calls on this matter that we're going to talk  
25 about?

1 A. We were posted at Main and Broad. I believe we  
2 were up the road, towards State Street a little bit.

3 Q. All right. So, does there come a point in time  
4 when you're advised of an initial call?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. How were you advised of this?

7 A. Our dispatcher will contact us on the radio at  
8 the caller truck number, ask our location and then  
9 dispatch the job.

10 Q. Do you have any other means of being updated  
11 about calls other than the dispatcher?

12 A. Every ambulance is assigned a company phone.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. When you are dispatched to a job, that  
15 information gets sent to the phone and it gives us the  
16 location and the initial note that was taken by the  
17 911 dispatcher.

18 Q. Okay. Where was the initial call dispatched to;  
19 where was your understanding of where the call was?

20 A. Main Street and Jefferson.

21 Q. What type of call was it?

22 A. We were dispatched with a psychiatric.

23 Q. Now, is that the type of call that you would go  
24 straight to the scene?

25 A. Not usually.

1 Q. And, why is that?

2 A. We try to keep ourselves safe and anything that  
3 has the potential to be violent or have weapons  
4 involved or things along those lines, we will stage  
5 until the police get there first.

6 Q. Okay. And, who clears you to come in?

7 A. The police contact their dispatcher, who then  
8 calls our dispatcher, who then clears us in.

9 Q. Okay. Approximately, what time was it that the  
10 original call came in for the psych?

11 A. Um.

12 Q. I'm not asking exact just --

13 A. Ten after three.

14 Q. Ten after three?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Okay. Did you go straight to the scene or did  
17 you stage?

18 A. We staged.

19 Q. And, do you recall approximately where you're  
20 staged?

21 A. I believe it was in the Nick Tahou's parking lot  
22 at Main and Broad.

23 Q. And, I'm not asking for exact distances, but  
24 approximately how many minutes would it take at, you  
25 know, 3:15, 3:30, to get from the Nick Tahou's parking

1 lot to Jefferson and Main?

2 A. About a minute, maybe two, if we hit every light.

3 Q. And then, to get from Main to -- Main and  
4 Jefferson to Main and Cady?

5 A. Again, maybe about a minute, a little less.

6 Q. Okay. All right. When you were in the parking  
7 lot of Nick Tahou's, did you get updated information  
8 about the call?

9 A. We got the information to our phone.

10 Q. And --

11 A. Which stated that, you know, the patient was  
12 running in the street naked, and covered in blood.

13 Q. So, upon hearing that information, did you start  
14 to form an opinion as to what type of call you may be  
15 responding to?

16 A. It made us concerned that we may be responding to  
17 an excited delirium patient.

18 Q. Okay. So, does AMR have any type of protocol  
19 where, if it appears just by virtue of description  
20 going on over the air, that somebody's naked and  
21 bleeding, that the person who is capable of providing  
22 ketamine should be directed to go to the scene or  
23 staged just to be available?

24 A. There's not.

25 Q. Okay. Did there come a point in time when you

1 are cleared to go to the scene?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And, where were you cleared to respond to?

4 A. Jefferson and Cady.

5 Q. And, did you proceed there immediately?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. What did you see -- well, I'd like to withdraw  
8 that. Did you and your partner have any type of  
9 discussion as to who would do what when you arrived on  
10 scene?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. What was the ultimate outcome of that?

13 A. So, our discussion consisted of our plan, should  
14 the patient be in excited delirium. The initial plan  
15 was that [REDACTED] was going make initial patient contact,  
16 attempt to work with the police to get him restrained  
17 safely to the stretcher, if possible, and I was to get  
18 medications drawn up to sedate the patient, if he  
19 needed to be, and to get in contact with our  
20 Supervisor to get ketamine to the scene.

21 Q. Okay. Who was driving the ambulance at that  
22 point?

23 A. I was.

24 Q. So, are you also authorized to drive, as well as  
25 be a Paramedic?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Can you explain to the Grand Jury when you  
3 arrived, what did you see?

4 A. As we pulled up on scene, we noticed the patient  
5 was being held to the ground, face down by a number of  
6 officers, I believe it was four. He was naked. He  
7 was covered in, whether it was sweat or water, we're  
8 not sure. There was a spit sock over his head. He  
9 was screaming, I could not make out what was being  
10 said, if anything, and he appeared to be actively  
11 struggling against the officers, arching his back,  
12 rolling side to side.

13 Q. Okay. So, were you able to see whether he was  
14 able to move against the restraint that was being  
15 used?

16 A. He did appear to be able to move against it.

17 Q. Okay. Did you note that in your PCR?

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. Did what you were seeing confirm what you had  
20 originally suspected?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. All right. And, that was?

23 A. That he was most likely experiencing excited  
24 delirium.

25 Q. What did you do at that point?

1 A. So. I exited the ambulance, along with my  
2 partner, I walked around the back of the ambulance. I  
3 believe I got a brief report from the officer just  
4 stating, we found him like this, we've been fighting  
5 with him. I then proceeded to the side door of the  
6 ambulance to get to where my ALS equipment is kept to  
7 get a syringe and a needle to start drawing up versed  
8 to sedate him. At the same time I was on the phone  
9 and radio requesting my Supervisor to the scene to get  
10 the ketamine that was more appropriate for his  
11 condition.

12 Q. So, were you going to administer both?

13 A. My goal was to get ketamine there and administer  
14 just that, but at the time I did not know where in the  
15 City my Supervisor was, and in order to try to protect  
16 the patient from any injuries, if she did not make it  
17 to the scene, I was going to administer versed.

18 Q. Okay. Are you aware of what was going on  
19 relative to your partner and Mr. Prude?

20 A. Not entirely. We had -- we had a level of trust  
21 where he had a job, I had a job, we went and did those  
22 jobs. So, I had -- you know, my back was turned to  
23 him at that point so I could draw up the medication.  
24 I was using the bench in the ambulance as a table at  
25 that point. So, aside from him communicating with me,

1 I had really no interaction.

2 Q. Okay. So, did you actually have the versed drawn  
3 at the time that you learned something had changed?

4 A. The dose of versed for excited delirium requires  
5 two vials of medication. I had had the first vial  
6 drawn up and was in the process of drawing up the  
7 second.

8 Q. What happens when you're in the process of  
9 drawing up the second?

10 A. [REDACTED] calls my name and says he needs me.

11 Q. What happens at that point?

12 A. I turned and proceeded to the patient. At this  
13 point, he was quiet and no longer struggling. The  
14 officers had backed off of him. I believe it was me  
15 who instructed them to roll him onto his back and I  
16 asked if he had a pulse.

17 Q. And, what did you learn?

18 A. I was told that they weren't sure if he had a  
19 pulse but they didn't believe so, and I instructed  
20 them to begin CPR while we got the handcuff key to get  
21 the handcuffs off.

22 Q. Are you aware -- or, is it your memory that it  
23 was you that said to roll Mr. Prude over?

24 A. I believe so.

25 Q. And, is it your memory that it was you that

1 requested that he be un-handcuffed?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Did there come a point in time when you made any  
4 type of comment to an officer relative to what you  
5 believed had happened?

6 A. While we were waiting for the handcuffs to be  
7 removed, I had stepped back. Somebody, I don't recall  
8 who, made a comment saying, what the F happened, and I  
9 had a brief interaction of, you know, I believed he  
10 was in excited delirium and that was probably what  
11 caused his cardiac arrest. Beyond that, I didn't have  
12 any conversation with them.

13 Q. Okay. Did you begin CPR?

14 A. [REDACTED] did.

15 Q. Okay. Was Mr. Prude's heart or pulse in any way  
16 monitored?

17 A. So, I applied defibrillator pads to him, just  
18 like you see with the AED, and they were connected to  
19 my cardiac monitor, which allows me to see the heart  
20 rhythm.

21 Q. Okay. And what, if anything, did you observe?

22 A. So, he was in what's called PEA, which is  
23 pulseless electrical activity.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. So, there was electrical activity going on. It

1 was a slow rate, but there was no pulse associated  
2 with it.

3 Q. Okay. And, what, if anything, did that indicate  
4 to you?

5 A. It indicated that, you know, it was very possible  
6 that his cause of arrest was acidosis or excited  
7 delirium and that we needed to treat it as such.

8 Q. Okay. Did there ever come a time when Mr. Prude  
9 regained a pulse?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Was this on his own or with medical assistance?

12 A. It was after medication had been administered.

13 Q. Which medications?

14 A. Epinephrine and sodium bicarbonate.

15 Q. What do epinephrine and sodium bicarbonate do  
16 relative to individuals who have suffered cardiac  
17 arrest?

18 A. So, epinephrine is theoretically believed to  
19 cause basal constriction, it slows down --

20 Q. So, can you just say what is basal constriction?

21 A. It's squeezing down the blood vessels and the  
22 extremities and any none core of the body.

23 Q. Okay. And, is the idea that when that happens,  
24 more blood is available to the core organs?

25 A. Theoretically.

1 Q. And, you're not testifying as an expert?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. Okay. You've been trained to provide  
4 epinephrine?

5 A. Correct. In all cases of cardiac arrest.

6 Q. And, that was done in this case?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. And, I think you mentioned sodium bicarbonate?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. And, what is that?

11 A. That is a medication that we give to try to  
12 correct acidosis.

13 Q. Okay. Approximately how long was it before Mr.  
14 Prude regained a pulse?

15 A. Approximately 18 to 20 minutes.

16 Q. Okay. At that point -- I'd like to withdraw  
17 that. If he had not regained a pulse, what would have  
18 happened?

19 A. We would have continued treatment on scene in an  
20 attempt to get his pulse back. If, after 30 to 40  
21 minutes he did not have a pulse, we would have  
22 transported him to the hospital without a pulse and  
23 left it up to the hospital, kind of, what the next  
24 steps would be.

25 Q. Okay. So, you would have transported him even if

1 he did not have a pulse?

2 A. Only because we were in the back of the ambulance  
3 and on the street, yes.

4 Q. Okay. All right. What was his condition upon  
5 arrival at Strong Hospital?

6 A. He had a pulse. He did have a blood pressure.  
7 We were giving him medication to maintain that blood  
8 pressure. He had no respiratory effort on his own, we  
9 were breathing for him, and he had no signs of  
10 neurological function. No opening his eyes or  
11 anything like that.

12 Q. Can you explain what agonal or guppy breaths are?

13 A. They're gasping breaths, usually less than six  
14 breaths a minute. It's commonly associated with  
15 cardiac arrest and they're ineffective. They're not  
16 -- it's not true breathing.

17 Q. All right. What you just described as agonal or  
18 guppy breaths, do they occur before or after a cardiac  
19 arrest?

20 A. It's not truly known. It's believed they may  
21 start immediately before, but it's hard to say.

22 Q. All right. So, it's just something that's  
23 associated?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. And, this is based on your training and

1 experience?

2 A. Correct.

3 Q. Okay. So, you -- in reviewing this matter, do  
4 you -- it appears from looking at the video, that  
5 there was -- I'd like to withdraw that. Would you  
6 agree that in an excited delirium type of situation,  
7 time is very important?

8 A. In every call, there is an element of time, yes.

9 Q. Right. Except that, there's probably a  
10 difference between, like, maybe a broken leg and  
11 something like this. I'm not trying --

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. -- to be -- would you agree with that?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. Do you -- it may appear that there was really no  
16 sense of urgency with this situation, would you agree  
17 with that?

18 A. No.

19 Q. All right. Can you explain what you mean by  
20 that?

21 A. From an outside perspective maybe, it may appear  
22 that we are moving slowly or don't care, but that's  
23 entirely out of training. We're taught to move slowly  
24 and methodically to avoid making mistakes and avoid  
25 injuring ourselves or other people. I was taught slow

1 is smooth, smooth is fast. So, taking a moment to  
2 stop and think and assessing the scene before making  
3 any rash judgments tends to lead to better outcomes.

4 Q. Do you think, kind of, proceeding this way, like,  
5 slowly and deliberately, is that -- are you able to  
6 sort of, pick up information that's given to you  
7 better when you're moving slow?

8 A. In my experience, yes.

9 Q. Okay. And, I just -- was it your understanding,  
10 as you were going through this, that there was a bit  
11 of a search for a handcuff key?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Were you aware of whether or not a key was  
14 actually -- was available quickly?

15 A. No. I distinctly recall saying, we need to get  
16 the cuffs off, and there was some amount of time where  
17 nobody seemed to provide a key. Whether they had one  
18 or not, I'm not sure.

19 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. Does anyone have any  
20 questions for Ms. [REDACTED]? Yes?

21 A JUROR: Does the ambulance have a dash  
22 cam?

23 BY MS. SOMMERS:

24 Q. Does AMR ambulance have either body worn cameras  
25 or dash cam?

1 A. We have dash cams that are activated, either  
2 manually or by sudden movements and G forces.

3 Q. Okay. Do you know if they were activated in this  
4 instance?

5 A. I don't believe they were.

6 Q. Okay. Thank you.

7 A JUROR: On video, we heard you say to the  
8 police that it's not your fault, you need to do what  
9 you need to do to keep yourself safe. What were you  
10 referring to?

11 THE WITNESS: As I said earlier, I don't  
12 know who made the statement, what the F happened. At  
13 that point, I was trying to keep everybody calm. The  
14 police appeared very anxious and upset. At that  
15 point, my partner was anxious and upset and my primary  
16 goal was to keep everybody calm, focused and trying to  
17 provide the best care because I needed help.

18 A JUROR: All right. Thank you. I'm just  
19 wondering the keep yourself safe part. What were you  
20 referring to?

21 THE WITNESS: They had told me that he was  
22 combative and had been fighting with them. So, the  
23 use of a restraint to prevent him from injuring them  
24 would be my guess there.

25 A JUROR: I have another question. Your

1 partner has a lower level of training than you do and  
2 less experience, lower level of training?

3 THE WITNESS: Yes.

4 A JUROR: This might be a hypothetical, but  
5 if you had been at Daniel Prude's side and saw his  
6 breathing become very shallow and seemed to be gasping  
7 for air and that he also threw up, would there have  
8 been a different reaction, as far as what you might  
9 have said to the restraint on his back or his  
10 position.

11 THE WITNESS: It's possible. As written in  
12 my PCR, when I first saw the patient, there was not  
13 somebody on his head that I could see, but the only  
14 real reason that [REDACTED] was initially at the patient's  
15 side is because I'm the only one who can draw up the  
16 medication. He's not able to carry or draw up the  
17 medications. It's hard to speculate if it would have  
18 been different, because unfortunately it wasn't.

19 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you. Yes?

20 A JUROR: [REDACTED] in the witness' testimony,  
21 she mentioned that the patient got a pulse back 18 to  
22 20 minutes later. Could you clarify where the patient  
23 was located at that time?

24 BY MS. SOMMERS:

25 Q. At the time that Mr. Prude obtained a pulse, was

1 able to get a pulse, where was he located?

2 A. On the stretcher in the back of the ambulance.

3 A JUROR: Enroute to the hospital?

4 THE WITNESS: No. We were still stationary.  
5 Our goal is to not move until we have a pulse, if  
6 possible.

7 MS. SOMMERS: So, unfortunately, we're going  
8 to have to take a break and come back. As I mentioned  
9 before, we have somebody that can't wait. How many  
10 questions are left? Can I ask how many?

11 A JUROR: One.

12 MS. SOMMERS: Let me see if -- well,  
13 actually, no. I don't want to rush anything.

14 I'm just going to instruct you, you're not  
15 to talk to any other witnesses when you leave here and  
16 you're going to be recalled at 1:30. So, I apologize  
17 but we just -- we have to -- to take somebody else.

18 Okay. So, with that, I'm going to excuse  
19 the witness. She's not going to discuss her  
20 testimony, nor is she going to discuss what occurred  
21 in here with anybody until after she is recalled and  
22 according to her choice. Okay?

23 THE WITNESS: Sounds good.

24 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you. All right. So the  
25 reason that -- well, I'll wait.

1                   (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
2 room at a time of 11:49.)  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1 MS. SOMMERS: So, the reason that we, kind  
2 of, had a hard stop there is we do have a witness who  
3 is testifying virtually. We do have a -- I will note  
4 for the record that we do have a court order allowing  
5 this.

6 (Whereupon, the witness appeared virtually  
7 at a time of 11:52 a.m.)

8 MS. SOMMERS: Are you able to see me?

9 DR. [REDACTED]: I see you.

10 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you. So, just give me  
11 one second. The foreperson of the Grand Jury is going  
12 to come down and swear you in, and we're going to put  
13 you up on the screen.

14

15 **D O C T O R** [REDACTED] [REDACTED] after  
16 being duly called and sworn, testified as follows:

17

18 **EXAMINATION BY MS. SOMMERS:**

19 Q. In addition -- before we introduce you, in  
20 addition to swearing to tell the truth, do you swear  
21 that you are in a secure location with no other  
22 individuals present?

23 A. I do swear, yes.

24 Q. So, this is a Grand Jury. Grand Jury is a secret  
25 proceeding and you are also maintaining secrecy?

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. All right. Thank you. All right. Could you  
3 please introduce yourself to the Grand Jury, who can  
4 see you. And, when it comes time to ask questions,  
5 I'll actually turn my screen, but please introduce  
6 yourself?

7 A. Sure. My name is [REDACTED]. I'm an Emergency  
8 Physician here in San Diego.

9 Q. Thank you. I neglected to do one thing. We're  
10 recording this in case the Judge wants to review it.  
11 So, just one moment, please.

12 A JUROR: How do you spell the last name?

13 BY MS. SOMMERS:

14 Q. Could you spell your last name?

15 A. It's [REDACTED], as in [REDACTED]

16 Q. Okay. Thank you. Doctor [REDACTED], where do you  
17 work?

18 A. I work at the University of California San Diego  
19 Medical Center here in San Diego, California.

20 Q. Thank you. So, you are actually testifying from  
21 San Diego?

22 A. I am, yes.

23 Q. I imagine it's nicer out there than it is here,  
24 but we won't get into that. Do you know, or have you  
25 ever worked with anyone who is a member of the

1 Rochester Police Department?

2 A. I have not.

3 Q. Okay. Actually, do you know anyone in the City  
4 of Rochester?

5 A. Unless you live there, no, I know nobody.

6 Q. Okay. All right. Thank you. Can you explain  
7 for the Grand Jury what you do for a living?

8 A. Sure. I'm an Emergency Physician. So, my -- my  
9 training and practice is to work in the Emergency  
10 Departments taking care of patients of all types.

11 Q. All right. And, how long have you been a  
12 physician?

13 A. I finished medical school in 1992, so I've been  
14 practicing as an Emergency Physician for almost 30  
15 years.

16 Q. Thank you. Are you still a practicing Physician?

17 A. I have a shift this afternoon, that's why I'm all  
18 dressed up for you.

19 Q. Okay. Thank you. Do you hold any other  
20 positions other than an Emergency Room Physician?

21 A. I have academic positions, so I'm a full  
22 professor of clinical emergency medicine in the School  
23 of Medicine at UCSD, and then I hold other, sort of,  
24 administrative roles and we work in the hospital and  
25 outside of the hospital.

1 Q. Thank you. Do you have any particular specialty  
2 relating to restraints and restraint related deaths?

3 A. I do, yes.

4 Q. Okay. Could you just please describe for the  
5 Grand Jury what that is based on, the kind of body of  
6 your knowledge base?

7 A. Sure. Really, since back in the 1990's when I  
8 was the chief resident for our program, I started  
9 doing research in the area of, it's a term you  
10 sometimes hear, as arrest related deaths. Restraints,  
11 some of the original restraint work back in the '90's  
12 looking at patients or subjects who would be on their  
13 stomach, in the prone position, handcuffed, legs  
14 pulled up. I've done research putting weights on  
15 their back, up to 225 pounds of weight to see what the  
16 physiologic effects are on individuals. How it  
17 effects, particularly, their breathing, their ability  
18 to ventilate, get oxygen in, get carbon dioxide out.  
19 Done research utilizing pepper spray, tasers, spit  
20 masks, or spit socks. So, I've looked at, really the  
21 research. And, it mainly focused on physiologic  
22 effects. How does one's physiology impact? Does it  
23 change heart rate, blood pressure, chemistry of  
24 parameters, but in particular, a lot of it's around  
25 the ventilation or breathing.

1 Q. Have you actually published anything relative to  
2 your area of expertise?

3 A. I have, yes. Probably about 40 to 50 peer review  
4 publications in the area of, sort of, arrests related  
5 deaths and agitation treatments. Um, written a  
6 textbook on the topic and I've written probably about,  
7 you know, 15 to 20 book chapters on the topic as well.

8 Q. In addition to working in an Emergency Room  
9 setting, do you -- do you also work at all in a  
10 custodial setting?

11 A. I've worked for 16 years at our county jail. So,  
12 San Diego Sheriff's Department is one of the busier  
13 areas. And, so, I worked, basically, every Monday  
14 down there in the clinics taking care of individuals  
15 at the jail sites, yes.

16 Q. Are you current on the scientific literature  
17 other than your own, relative to restraints and  
18 restraint related deaths?

19 A. I am, yes. In fact, with -- just a couple of  
20 months ago, I published a review of the entire  
21 literature, or the body of literature, on the topic of  
22 restraints and restraint related deaths, looking at  
23 all the research that's been published on that topic  
24 and consolidating to one paper.

25 Q. Okay. Thank you. During the course of your

1 career, as an Emergency Room Physician, up to and  
2 including today, have you had the opportunity to  
3 interact, work with, treat, individuals who are either  
4 in cardiac arrest or presenting with a history of  
5 cardiac arrest?

6 A. Yeah. I mean, on a regular basis, we see  
7 patients in our Emergency Department who have cardiac  
8 arrests. We take care of them over the phone as part  
9 of the base hospital. We see them in the ER. And, in  
10 fact, I was one of the National Institute of Health  
11 Principle Investigators in the largest cardiac arrest  
12 study done in the US and Canada in the last ten years.  
13 So, we look at tens of thousands of cardiac arrests or  
14 the perspective of evaluating the outcomes,  
15 treatments, you know, sort of, the cadence and  
16 treatment and things like that.

17 Q. Okay. Have you, during the course of your career  
18 also had the occasion to interact with, treat,  
19 observe, deal with individuals who have been subject  
20 to restraint?

21 A. On a daily basis.

22 Q. Okay.

23 A. Our Emergency Department -- well, I shouldn't say  
24 -- everyday that I'm in the ER, not that day is long.  
25 But, in the Emergency Department where the local

1 Department, sort of, does a lot of the screening for  
2 the Sheriff's Department and for the jail intake. So,  
3 a lot of field arrests come there directly. A lot of  
4 patients come there that are agitated with, sort of,  
5 an inner city population. So, we'll see a lot that  
6 come in full restraints or in forensic restraints as  
7 part of the restraining process, yes.

8 Q. And -- and, have you also had the opportunity to  
9 treat, observe clinically individuals who are under  
10 the influence of illicit substances?

11 A. Even more so than the restraints, yes. We have a  
12 very high population of illicit drug users. San Diego  
13 is very notorious for methamphetamine, but we still  
14 have cocaine, and PCP and LSD patients present. But,  
15 there -- you know, there's multiple patients per shift  
16 that have the influence of drugs but whether they're  
17 fully agitated and -- and wild and, sort of, that --  
18 that aspect versus just under the influence in a  
19 recreational way. But, yeah, we see them on a daily  
20 basis.

21 Q. So, you just mentioned PCP. Is that something  
22 that you see and observe in San Diego rarely,  
23 regularly? Just curious.

24 A. Sure. It's probably, I would say, rare to  
25 intermittent. It comes in phases, as far as -- you

1 know, we'll see periods where we see a number of them  
2 come in and then it sort of fades out of favor. But,  
3 over my career, I've taken care of probably hundreds  
4 of people on PCP, but it's not a -- not a daily or  
5 weekly event, necessarily.

6 Q. Okay. Thank you. Does -- does San Diego see  
7 enough of it to include it on its -- well, let me  
8 withdraw that. Does San Diego have a -- a drug screen  
9 used in the Emergency Room?

10 A. So, our hospital, I can only speak to that. We  
11 do use the urine drug toxicology screen when -- when  
12 necessary to evaluate patients, yes.

13 Q. Okay. And, is PCP one of the substances that is  
14 tested for on the drug screen?

15 A. On our drug screen, yes.

16 Q. Okay. Thank you. Dr. [REDACTED] are you aware of a  
17 term called excited or agitated delirium?

18 A. I am, yes.

19 Q. Could you explain to the Grand Jury what that is?

20 A. I guess there's a long version and a short  
21 version. In short, it's basically, a very extreme  
22 level of agitation, thought to be from a central neuro  
23 -- neuro transmitter issue that's happening within  
24 individuals. Clinically, it presents with, sort of,  
25 the extremes of -- of physiology. High heart rates,

1 high breathing rates, often high temperatures,  
2 agitated hots, you know, not fatiguing to what normal  
3 people would fatigue to, so sort of having an endless  
4 energy, if you want to look at it that way. They just  
5 keep going and going. And, they can be -- they can be  
6 violent. They can be agitated and they're typically  
7 delirious, as is part of the name there.

8 Q. Okay. Let me take you back a second. When --  
9 is this something new that -- that's just been, sort  
10 of, coined or discovered?

11 A. It is not. It's got a fairly long history  
12 actually.

13 Q. Okay. Thank you. Could you just kind of,  
14 briefly, give a little bit of the history?

15 A. Yeah. A quick -- quick review, yes. If you go  
16 back to the medical literature, back to the 1800's, it  
17 was first described in the medical literature by  
18 Dr. Luther Bell, not in the terms of excited delirium,  
19 but the concept of it. He saw psychiatric patients  
20 back in the day. There was schizophrenia, there was  
21 mania. And, unfortunately, in those days there was  
22 not treatments that were -- that well -- well done for  
23 it. There was no anti-psychotics. And, he reported  
24 patients who had come in and they would be agitated,  
25 they'd be hot, they'd be sweaty, they'd be delusional,

1 they'd think they were on fire, they would take off  
2 their clothes, temperatures of a 102, 103 from the  
3 psychiatric disorders. And, they would rev up, and  
4 rev up, and get more aggressive and he reported the  
5 mortality rate of 75 percent in that population. And,  
6 if you'd look through the medical literature over the  
7 1800's to the 1900's even up to the 1950's, there are  
8 many, many reports that this type of agitated,  
9 delusional behavior that revs up in this population of  
10 psychiatric patients.

11 In the 60's, we came up with, we the medical  
12 community, had the, I guess, discoveries of Thorazine  
13 and other anti-psychotic calming medications. And, we  
14 started using it on these psychiatric patients. They  
15 did well. They didn't have the mortality rates that  
16 you once would see. But then, come the 80's, you know  
17 what, 40 years ago, you start to see the drug trade  
18 coming across, and, particularly, in Miami and South  
19 Florida with cocaine. You start seeing this type of  
20 behavior showing up again, more on a compressed time  
21 scale. Issues of subjects would be using the  
22 recreational doses, in this case, often it was  
23 cocaine. And, uses a dose and the next thing you know  
24 they're out in the streets, they're running around,  
25 they're taking off their clothes, they're sweaty,

1 they're hot, they're agitated, they're, you know,  
2 violent, their lack of tiring. And, in certain -- in  
3 some issues of these patients, you know, many of them,  
4 the police got called because, sort of, the naked man  
5 running in town. So, they would be trying to get them  
6 into a controlled situation so that the Paramedics can  
7 take them to the hospital and a number of these people  
8 would die.

9           So, that was where excited delirium was  
10 actually coined as a term. And then, you see over the  
11 next 40 years, probably, about a hundred and plus  
12 publications of the medical literature, it's out  
13 there, treatments and things like that. So, not a new  
14 term, but it's -- often it's out there, I guess you  
15 could say.

16 Q. Okay. So, I just want to make sure to trace it  
17 properly. So, first, the -- the sort of symptoms  
18 we're seeing is with a subset of schizophrenic  
19 patients?

20 A. Yes. Mental health disorder patients.  
21 Typically, schizophrenics or man -- or patients with  
22 mania.

23 Q. Okay. And then, there was kind of an uptick in  
24 the 80's relative to cocaine use?

25 A. Cocaine use. And then, you start seeing other

1 parts of the country with other stimulant drugs.

2 Q. Okay.

3 A. Cocaine. A lot of the west coast in LA, in the  
4 early 90's, particularly, with PCP at the time. There  
5 was a piece survey written up by Sam Stratten at that  
6 time of 200 plus patients transported by Paramedics in  
7 the back of the ambulance in the gurney, going to the  
8 hospital, 11 percent of them died. They had cardiac  
9 arrests and died. So, it's across the country. But,  
10 yeah, the first time you saw it was in the 80's in  
11 Miami.

12 Q. Okay. So, what are the precipitating -- if I  
13 understood you correctly, what types of events might  
14 more commonly precipitate one of these excited  
15 delirium type events?

16 A. Sure. So, currently in our current environment,  
17 the most common ideology or cause of an excited  
18 delirium event is typically stimulant drugs. So,  
19 rough estimates are, probably 90 percent, are caused  
20 by drugs and maybe 10 percent are caused by untreated  
21 or under treated mental health disorders still.  
22 Though, drugs that tend to cause it, tend to be the  
23 ones that are the stimulants and then, the frequencies  
24 tend to be regional frequencies. So, on the west  
25 coast, we see a lot more of the PCP. In the northern

1 areas, Southern California, we see a lot of crystal  
2 meth. East coast, a lot of cocaine. But, those  
3 stimulant drugs are the ones that tend to be more  
4 associated with excited delirium. But, you see with  
5 bath salts and flocka and LSD and other drugs as well  
6 can do it.

7 Q. And, I just want to understand -- or, is it -- at  
8 a physiological level or an anatomical level, could  
9 you explain what has been learned up to this point  
10 about this?

11 A. Sure. I mean, originally, as I described back in  
12 the 80's, it was found when these people were dying,  
13 and, in a skull text, it'd be a lethal disease. And,  
14 so the original papers came out from medical  
15 examiners, who are seeing these individuals in the  
16 morgues, and thought it was a universal lethal  
17 disease. The reality is, the emergency medicine  
18 community has been seeing and taking care of them just  
19 as long and many, if not most of them, actually, most  
20 will survive given the appropriate treatment and  
21 sedation and -- and they have the ability to be  
22 converted, but still, some die.

23 The physiology is such that there's been  
24 work looking at trying to find a cause for this. Work  
25 out of Miami and Debra Mash's Group down there has

1 looked at the brains of individuals; and, actually,  
2 who have died of symptoms and diag -- diagnosed  
3 clinically with excited delirium compared to other  
4 individual brains; people who use other drugs but  
5 didn't die of excited delirium, for example, were  
6 shot, or died in a car crash, or had some other event.  
7 And, when they looked at the brains, they actually see  
8 anatomic changes. There's differences in these  
9 brains. And, not to get into too much detail, but I  
10 think most people understand they're nerves that  
11 communicate with each other in our brains and  
12 throughout our bodies, and that's how, you know,  
13 things happen. I want to move my hand, nerve  
14 impulses, go down these chains and make things happen  
15 and happens at, you know, micro millisecond levels.  
16 But, at the nerve level, there are neuro transmitters  
17 that go from one nerve to the other nerve. And, it  
18 gets released and it goes across, called a synaptic  
19 gap, and makes the other one turn on. And, in the  
20 brains of individuals with excited delirium, they've  
21 noticed changes in the neuro transmitters. The  
22 re-uptick of the neuro transmitters, there's a down  
23 regulation of it. A lot of -- lot of, sort of,  
24 medical microbe type stuff. But, the reality is the  
25 neuro transmitter ends up sitting in that synapse

1 longer than it should be. So, instead of a firing off  
2 and, you know, pass the message on down, it fires off  
3 and fires off and fires off and it's still keeping  
4 that activity level going in the nerve itself. So,  
5 you sort of see that physiologically it is -- it's  
6 just revving up an engine. It's -- the nerve impulses  
7 are just going and firing, which is why, clinically,  
8 we'll see high heart rates, high blood pressures, high  
9 and fast respiratory rates. A lot of these we'll see  
10 very elevated temperatures, 102, 103, 104. It  
11 probably gives that physiologic feeling of being hot,  
12 which is why a lot of these people likely take off  
13 their clothes. They don't know what's going on but  
14 they're feeling hot. It also gives the -- that  
15 physiological component of you're breaking system is  
16 not there. Everything is revving up, your energy, it  
17 gets, so to speak, it's revving up. You don't fatigue  
18 when others fatigue. You don't feel as much pain when  
19 others might feel pain. And so, that is sort of the  
20 physiology. But, it's thought that a central  
21 component in a portion of our brain is studied more by  
22 that group in Miami.

23 Q. Is everybody who consumes -- does everybody who  
24 consumes, for instance, a stimulant type drug express  
25 excited delirium?

1 A. No. Actually, the -- the minority of people do.  
2 So, meaning, lots of people use stimulant drugs, many  
3 on a recreational, regular basis. But, the incidence  
4 of excited delirium is fairly low. It's -- it's out  
5 there. You'll see cases here and cases there, and  
6 we'll see them in the Emergency Department, but  
7 relative to the amount of drugs consumed or the amount  
8 of people using drugs, it's -- it's a rather  
9 infrequent event. The concept that it doesn't happen  
10 to somebody who uses drugs for the first time, in  
11 general, is the thought. The thought there's some pre  
12 -- or we think there's some predisposition or  
13 preconditioning that happens. So, the people who use  
14 recreational drug levels, meaning their, I guess,  
15 normal dose, if you want to look at it that way, the  
16 recreational level of intake. This isn't an overdose.  
17 This isn't too much. This isn't a difference --  
18 recreation. It's something that triggers that brain,  
19 that we talked about there, that one it's time to  
20 synapses keep firing and firing. So -- but, it  
21 doesn't happen that frequently, but enough that we  
22 know about it.

23 Q. So, if two people even have the exact same  
24 history and consume the exact same amount, is there  
25 anything to say that they will -- one of them or both

1 of them will end up expressing this?

2 A. No. And, in fact, there may be some genetic  
3 predisposition at the synapse level we were talking  
4 about with those receptors. There may be some people  
5 who are more prone to getting that than others. But,  
6 there is no -- there is no way of looking at somebody  
7 physiologically or anatomic and saying, you're at risk  
8 and you're not, or your history puts you more at risk  
9 than not, beyond the idea that you're using drugs.  
10 So, if you're both using the same amount of drugs for  
11 the same period of time, there's no picking out if one  
12 or either of them will ever have excited delirium in  
13 their lifetime.

14 Q. Relative to the kind of universe of physicians  
15 and doctors who deal with this particular syndrome on  
16 a somewhat regular basis, I guess, who would those  
17 doctors be?

18 A. This -- this is primarily a disease of the  
19 Emergency setting -- this a sort of coming close to  
20 the time if something happens. In the field of a  
21 house, EMS gets called, law enforcement may get  
22 called. But, ultimately, the patient gets brought to  
23 the Emergency Department. These are our acute status  
24 patients that will get treatment. This is not  
25 somebody who ends up in the psychiatrist's chair.

1 This isn't something you feel coming on, that I'm not  
2 feeling well, I should go see my therapist or my -- my  
3 counselor. It is a trigger synapse, the switch flips  
4 and you're -- you don't even know what you're doing.  
5 I've taken care of many of these patients, where you  
6 sedate them, you calm them, you treat them overnight,  
7 you wake them up in the morning and they have no  
8 recall of what was going on that night because of the  
9 drugs and the central system that was going on.

10 But, this is an emergency medicine specific  
11 area. I've had -- gotten calls from my psychiatry  
12 colleagues down to see patients in the ED in the  
13 throes of this, and they want to have nothing to do  
14 with it. They're -- they're -- when patients calm,  
15 they think they need a psychiatrist, give me a call.  
16 So this is -- this is our world.

17 Q. And just to kind of follow up, what is the sort  
18 of most -- actually, I'd like to withdraw that. So,  
19 is syndrome recognized in the field of emergency  
20 medicine?

21 A. It is. It's actually formally been recognized by  
22 the American College of Emergency Physicians, which is  
23 our largest national body of -- of our specialty. So,  
24 they put out a white paper recognizing it,  
25 acknowledging it, going through the diagnostic

1 evaluation and recommended treatments at the time.

2 Q. Okay. And, as of today, I mean, I assume  
3 knowledge is increasing. What is the best treatment  
4 when someone is presenting with this collection or  
5 constellation of symptoms?

6 A. Sure. The -- the best things one can do for  
7 somebody who is in the throes of excited delirium is  
8 to rapidly or quickly restrain and control. And, you  
9 know, trying to avoid a lot of muscle contraction, a  
10 lot of arms and legs and stuff like that, that gets  
11 you a lot of that build up of lactic acidosis. The --  
12 and then, once you get them in a controlled manner,  
13 then it's a matter of sedating them. You want to use  
14 calming medications to bring down the heart rate, the  
15 blood pressure, the agitation, the delusions, the  
16 temperature, all those things. There's other things,  
17 like, IV fluids and things like that. But, really,  
18 it's rapid control and rapid calming are the two  
19 things that are -- are the sort of at the foremost to  
20 try to address these individuals.

21 Q. Now, when you say sedation, can I -- I assume --  
22 are you saying that everyone who's just, kind of,  
23 unruly should be sedated?

24 A. No. This is a very special population that is --  
25 it's -- it's sort of, when you see it, it's an

1 aggressive, you know, rapid -- you know, sort of, not  
2 always violent, but certainly acting in a behavior  
3 that is just revving, revving, you know, going, going,  
4 going type of thing. Repetitive talking, just  
5 breathing fast, working fast. Their -- their  
6 metabolic processes are revved up and putting  
7 physiologic stress on their system, it's like putting  
8 a car to the red line there with the gas on. It's  
9 revving, it's running, it's moving. But, if you don't  
10 back it off a little bit, it can blow an engine. And,  
11 so, these people are revving, revving, revving. So,  
12 that's the population that needs calming, not just  
13 somebody who is under the influence or a little bit  
14 intoxicated or just, you know, odd behavior. That's  
15 -- that's not what we're referring to here.

16 Q. Okay. What is it that generally will -- or, what  
17 is commonly understood to cause death in individuals  
18 experiencing this?

19 A. You know, there -- there's no pure way of  
20 predicting this. That's the challenge of it. We know  
21 that the more aggressive, the more revved up they seem  
22 to be, the more often we'll see associated cardiac  
23 arrest with it. The longer a struggle goes on,  
24 meaning fighting and revving and doing things to get  
25 those muscle groups doing a lot of lactic acid

1 production, or a lot of activity preceding that, can  
2 potentially create the acidosis that puts them at  
3 risk. In patients or subjects in which you get a  
4 temperature that is significantly elevated, it's  
5 thought that that is associated with the higher risk  
6 of cardiac arrest, implying that there's a -- central  
7 system is already revving up and you can manifest that  
8 by an elevated temperature.

9 Q. Is that -- is the elevated temperature why these  
10 individuals being naked is -- well, let me -- I'd like  
11 to withdraw that. Is being naked a bit of a hallmark  
12 in these types of cases?

13 A. It certainly is. If you see a naked, sweaty  
14 person or naked, hot person running around,  
15 particularly, in an environment that you wouldn't  
16 expect to see it in, that -- and, I teach police  
17 officers and paramedics. That is a trigger that  
18 something is going on, and it's more likely than not  
19 it would be something like excited delirium. That's  
20 just -- it's not a common -- it's a very common  
21 feature for it. Does everyone for excited delirium  
22 come up naked, no. But, when you see that somebody  
23 doing that sort of behavioral pattern that we're  
24 discussing, that is excited delirium in my mind until  
25 otherwise.

1 Q. Based on -- so, if I understand correctly, is it  
2 the underlying acidosis that's believed to be the --  
3 how does the acidosis affect a person's prognosis for  
4 a cardiac arrest?

5 A. Sure. So, there's a couple parts to the cardiac  
6 arrest aspect in this particular population.  
7 Oftentimes there are, you know, sort of, chronic genes  
8 in the heart that occurs with, sort of, chronic or  
9 intermittent drug use. The heart itself is an organ  
10 that likes to work. When you put drugs in the system,  
11 specifically, stimulant drugs, PCP, methamphetamine,  
12 cocaine, when you put that in the system, it revs up  
13 the heart. It makes the heart work harder, it makes  
14 it beat tougher, it makes it run faster. All that's a  
15 physiological stress on the heart. Now, you add  
16 acidosis to that. Acidosis is really a dropping of  
17 your pH. Our normal body pH is 7.4. What we'll see  
18 is people who are particularly more active, more  
19 aggressive, more physiologically moving things can  
20 drive that needle down, push the pH to a lower level  
21 because you're creating acid in their blood. Lactic  
22 acid is that -- that acid you feel when you feel the  
23 burn. If you've ever done a bunch of stairs or the  
24 Stairmaster or screwing a screw driver in, you get the  
25 forearm burning. That burning is the buildup of

1 lactic acid in that particular muscle group. These  
2 individuals are getting that in all the groups. You  
3 know, running around, struggling, fighting, jumping,  
4 doing things like that, those are using big muscle  
5 groups. Those muscle groups are creating more lactic  
6 acid, which goes into the bloodstream and lowers his  
7 pH.

8           So, now, you have a heart that's already  
9 irritated by the stimulant drugs, it's already working  
10 hard, it's already -- lactic acidosis in and of  
11 itself, even without drugs, can cause the heart to  
12 stop. So, now, you have two things in the system that  
13 are affecting the heart in a negative way. The drugs  
14 itself directly and the acidosis both can cause a  
15 sudden cardiac arrest.

16 Q. Thank you. Based on the scientific literature,  
17 as well as your own experiences, do all individuals  
18 who ultimately die after experiencing an excited  
19 delirium related event do so while being restrained by  
20 police officers?

21 A. No. They -- they die during restraint, they die  
22 without any restraints. They die in the back of  
23 ambulances as I referred to. There were two hundred  
24 plus cases reported by the group in LA many years ago,  
25 they were in the back of an ambulance. They die in

1 the Emergency Departments. We have had deaths in our  
2 own Emergency Department that weren't being restrained  
3 by police officers, they weren't prone, they weren't  
4 with, you know, different types of aspects. So, it is  
5 a -- it's a physiologic medical emergency. And --  
6 but, they can die in any position or in any location.

7 Q. So, I was just going to ask, I think -- well,  
8 I'll withdraw that. Does a person need to be in the  
9 prone position, in other words, face down or -- or mid  
10 rift down in order to experience a cardiac arrest  
11 event related to excited delirium?

12 A. The answer is no. People in excited delirium die  
13 in a sitting position, they die in the back of an  
14 ambulance gurney on their back, they die in the prone  
15 position, they die on their sides, they die on  
16 hospital beds. So, the position itself is independent  
17 of the -- the deaths associated with excited delirium.  
18 It's the inside stuff that's going on. The revving of  
19 the engine, and all that stuff that causing it. It's  
20 not position based. The position doesn't impact it,  
21 it doesn't effect the metabolic processes or the  
22 ventilatory processes.

23 Q. Would you agree that the -- just the fighting  
24 against being restrained would, in and of itself,  
25 would generate some acid that wouldn't otherwise be

1 generated?

2 A. Well, that's -- that's a good question. So, the  
3 idea of having somebody being restrained. We've  
4 restrained people in the ED all the time,  
5 unfortunately, because of that type of very aggressive  
6 behavior, they will struggle against the restraint.  
7 Whether it's a forensic restraint, as the handcuffs  
8 or, you know, we have these restraints that keep  
9 people from moving around. They can move back and  
10 forth, but their not doing the flexion and  
11 contractions type of stuff. They're not using the big  
12 biceps and triceps. They're using large muscle groups  
13 that actually generate a lot more of that lactic acid.  
14 You can create a little bit of activity here, but the  
15 -- the risk of not having them in that, sort of, I  
16 think, swell -- you're holding them so they can't do  
17 that much. They can still resist a bit, but the  
18 reality is in the large muscle group. The thighs, the  
19 calves, those muscle groups, the arms create a lot of  
20 lactic acid in a very short period of time. That's  
21 why you see, if you ever watched MMA or boxing, they  
22 get very fatigued after a couple of minutes of rounds  
23 of fighting. It's a very fatigued type of thing  
24 because of that lactic acid. And, so, the controlling  
25 of them, whether it's restraints, forensic restraints

1 or hospital restraints, that reduces that ability to  
2 create the lactic -- doesn't stop it, but it reduces  
3 it.

4 Q. And, can I assume that in the Emergency  
5 Department, sedative, ketamine are readily available.  
6 You don't have to wait for someone to bring them to  
7 the Emergency Department?

8 A. We have them in the Emergency. Other than a  
9 couple of minutes of getting them out of the machine,  
10 yes, they're available to us.

11 Q. All right. Are you, in your capacity, ever asked  
12 to review matters in order to determine, whether in  
13 your opinion, a particular restraint caused or  
14 contributed to the death of an individual?

15 A. I have been asked to do that, yes.

16 Q. Okay. And, have you ever reviewed matters and  
17 determined that, yes, the restraint did cause or  
18 contributed, potentially, to an individual's death?

19 A. I have reviewed cases in which I thought the  
20 restraint process, procedure, was problematic and may  
21 have contributed, yes.

22 Q. Okay. And, have you, likewise, reviewed matters  
23 where you determined or based -- your opinion was that  
24 the restraint did not cause or contribute to the  
25 death?

1 A. That would be correct, yes.

2 Q. All right. Could you, just kind of, walk through  
3 -- walk the Grand Jury through the process that you  
4 used in order to form your opinion in that regard?

5 A. Sure. When asked to evaluate a case to see if  
6 there was issues with regard to a restraining process,  
7 you want to review the materials available. You want  
8 to obtain records, videos, testimony or interviews.  
9 You want to look at the EMS records, the hospital  
10 records. You want to look at the totality of the --  
11 of the circumstances going on there, with  
12 specifically, to the restraining process though, you  
13 want to know certain things. You want to know how  
14 long somebody was in the restraint process, meaning,  
15 most of the time it's a concern about weight being  
16 placed on them. Did the weight have an impact and was  
17 ventilation being impacted? That's usually the  
18 question being asked. So, you want to know, was there  
19 weight being used? Where was the weight placed? How  
20 long was the weight being placed there? Was there any  
21 obstruction to the airway itself? Was there evidence  
22 that there wasn't obstruction of the airway? Were  
23 they able to talk or were they able to yell? Were  
24 they able to do so on a regular basis or was it  
25 intermittent? And then, you want the to know, sort

1 of, the timing of everything. How long this whole  
2 event occurred or took because if you're looking to  
3 see if the potential for asphyxia is there, it takes  
4 quite a while for somebody to truly asphyxiate, and  
5 so, the timing of it is important to look at as well.

6 Q. When you use the term asphyxia, could you --  
7 could you describe what you are referring to?

8 A. Sure. I'm referring to the inability or the  
9 restriction of an individual to be able to get oxygen  
10 into their system. So, everything from -- well, from  
11 the mouth to covering the neck and, you know, crushing  
12 the airway to restricting breathing. All those would  
13 be ways of creating that environment of asphyxia,  
14 where you don't have the oxygen -- adequate oxygen  
15 coming into your lungs' system.

16 Q. Okay. If -- if the term asphyxia is used to  
17 mean, you know, inadequate blood pumping -- or,  
18 inadequate oxygen in the blood, could that also be  
19 caused by a cardiac arrest?

20 A. A cardiac arrest will stop all blood flow. A  
21 cardiac arrest will also stop all ventilation because  
22 people don't breathe during cardiac arrest. So, that  
23 would create a no flow state. So, that would be, I  
24 guess, in a technical sense, a form of asphyxiation  
25 because the cells are not receiving oxygen rich blood.

1 Q. Okay. In the case of Daniel Prude, were you  
2 asked to review this matter?

3 A. I was, yes.

4 Q. And, were you provided with the medical records,  
5 the Medical Examiner's report, photographs, the -- the  
6 video of the incident?

7 A. Yes, I was give a -- a large file to review that  
8 included all that material.

9 Q. Okay. And, were you able to form an opinion as  
10 to whether or not the restraint involved caused or  
11 contributed to Mr. Prude's death?

12 A. I did come to a conclusion, yes.

13 Q. All right. Could you explain to the Grand Jury  
14 the conclusions that you made relative to -- well,  
15 actually, I'd like to withdraw that. Did you analyze  
16 whether or not the -- the spit hood that was placed  
17 over Mr. Prude's head caused or contributed to his  
18 death?

19 A. I did, yes.

20 Q. And, could you explain for the Grand Jury what  
21 you determined and what you based that on?

22 A. Sure. So, my opinion is that the spit hood that  
23 was utilized did not have any cause or contribution to  
24 the cardiac arrest and ultimate death of Mr. Prude.  
25 The spit hood itself is a very loose, mesh material.

1 It's very easy to breathe through because of the  
2 meshiness of it. It goes around the head. It doesn't  
3 impact ventilations. It doesn't impact breathing. It  
4 doesn't impact the ability to get air in or oxygen in  
5 or CO2 carbon dioxide out. This has been studied.  
6 It's been published and it's reviewed to show that  
7 these devices are -- are safe from that perspective.

8 In the case of Mr. Prude, it was placed on  
9 him, it was on for a very modest period of time before  
10 he was actually moved to the ground for additional  
11 control. He was clearly breathing and talking and --  
12 and articulating through there and expressing no  
13 events of respiratory distress. In general, people  
14 who have respiratory issues aren't yelling or talking  
15 or constantly talking. In the ER, if you have a bad  
16 asthmatic or a bad con -- congestive heart failure  
17 patient, they often say nothing. They answer with  
18 nods, and yeses and noes, that way. They tend to have  
19 one word sentences in speaking. So, his clinical  
20 presentations with the mask had no effect on him,  
21 which is what would be expected from all the  
22 scientific data out there. And then, when he was  
23 placed into the -- the on the ground position, the  
24 more prone position, you can still hear him talking.  
25 There was a period where he did have an episode of

1 vomiting during the end. But, that appeared to be  
2 more related to the cardiac arrest and didn't impact  
3 the ability to ventilate. And, first of all, it  
4 wouldn't be because there's plenty of air to go  
5 around. But, secondly, it was probably more related  
6 to the -- the actual heart stopping event that had  
7 occurred at that time.

8 Q. Okay. Did you form an opinion relative to  
9 whether or not Mr. Prude was experiencing an excited  
10 delirium syndrome event?

11 A. I did have an opinion, yes.

12 Q. And, what was your opinion in that regard?

13 A. My opinion that, after reviewing the materials,  
14 the video, and all the aspects we've talked about as  
15 far as things available to me, that he was showing  
16 signs and symptoms consistent with an excited delirium  
17 event.

18 Q. And, could you just very briefly say what those  
19 were?

20 A. Sure. The first thing that gets your attention  
21 is running around naked in 34 degree weather. That's  
22 a hallmark finding. It's not diagnostic, but it's  
23 certainly very common to have that diagnosis  
24 associated with it. But, the other signs and symptoms  
25 that were there was when he had a stimulant drug in

1 his system, PCP, so you have a cause for it.

2 He was definitely delirious and delusional,  
3 so you have the delirium aspect of it with a lot of  
4 the comments he was saying out there. He was a -- a  
5 lack of fatigue. He ran, I guess, almost a mile prior  
6 to this, and just was active, active, active, active.  
7 You watch him on the ground, he's still talking and  
8 moving, trying to get up and that type of activity.  
9 He was felt to be breathing -- known to be breathing  
10 fast. As far as the idea of him being hot, there is  
11 some evidence he may have been sweaty or not but it's  
12 hard to tell in the video there. He certainly was  
13 having lack of what appeared to be tolerance to pain.  
14 Running around in the streets in bare feet at  
15 nighttime, didn't seem to be bothered by that. There  
16 was evidence of some bleeding and stuff like that,  
17 potentially, that again, not being bothered by what  
18 seemed to be painful stimuli.

19 So, all those things are consistent with the  
20 diagnostic criteria for excited delirium syndrome.

21 Q. What, if any -- did you form an opinion as to  
22 what was the cause of death, or -- yeah. What was the  
23 cause of Mr. Prude's death?

24 A. Yes, I did have an opinion on that.

25 Q. What was it -- I want to rephrase it a little

1 bit. I understand that he was in the hospital, and  
2 that his -- his pulse was -- he was -- the EMTs were  
3 able to regenerate a pulse, but did you form an  
4 opinion as to what caused him to lose his pulse to  
5 begin with?

6 A. I did, yes.

7 Q. And, what was that?

8 A. So, the -- my opinion is that, he was having an  
9 excited delirium event. He was clearly, again, sort  
10 of, metabolically revved up. You can tell by his  
11 physiologic presence there, the agitation, the trying  
12 to -- the getting up. The fact that he was running  
13 around. We know that he had built up a -- a level of  
14 lactic acidosis in his system. So, his heart was  
15 working hard. He had PCP, which is a strong oxygen  
16 level drug in his system and it was clearly effecting  
17 him physiologically. And then, the acidosis itself.  
18 The continued activity lowered the pH. And, again, as  
19 I was saying earlier, not everybody goes into cardiac  
20 arrest, but oftentimes you get to a certain level.  
21 The heart just is not able to continue taking that, in  
22 a sense, intensity or the abuse of the drugs and the  
23 acidosis at the same time, it eventually -- it has a  
24 sudden event and goes into cardiac arrest. In this  
25 case, a PEA arrest, we call it, a pulseless electrical

1 activity, which is common in excited delirium, that  
2 PEA arrest caused a cascade of other events, which  
3 ultimately lead to the death, you know, days later.  
4 But, it's the cardiac arrest from the excited delirium  
5 that contributed to his death. The multiple organ  
6 failure and death.

7 Q. Did you form any opinions as to when Mr. Prude  
8 likely suffered the cardiac arrest?

9 A. I do have opinions to that, yes.

10 Q. What is that -- what do you base it on, and what  
11 was it?

12 A. Sure. So, if -- if you'd look at the video and  
13 the materials available, you know, looking at the  
14 point where he was placed on the ground and being held  
15 in several positions, he was talking, he was still  
16 mumbling, he was still saying things, he was moving  
17 air in and out. So, we know at those points he, I  
18 guess, in a sense, want to say showing signs of life.  
19 He was alive, he was conscious, he was breathing and  
20 would have had a heart beat at that time.

21           Around the time when the officer asked if  
22 he's okay, they noticed a slight change in his  
23 activity level, I guess. It -- sort of, in his  
24 movements. And then he, sort of, vomits or  
25 regurgitates, I look at it because I think vomiting is

1 more of a forceful activity. Often, in cardiac  
2 arrests you see sort of a regurgitation. Things sort  
3 of ooze their way back out. Right around that time is  
4 probably when his heart stopped and his effective  
5 breathing stopped.

6 Q. Is it uncommon to see regurgitation at or right  
7 after a cardiac event?

8 A. It is -- it's not uncommon. It doesn't happen  
9 all the time, but sometimes as the body, sort of, gets  
10 relaxed, as in a cardiac arrest phase, things tend to  
11 happen like that where you lose continence of your  
12 stool, or you vomit up. It's not everybody, but it  
13 does happen. We do see it in that time and period.

14 The other thing of note was when you look at  
15 the video, right after this event occurred, the  
16 officers were, sort of -- you can see the back of Mr.  
17 Prude and he has these, sort of, breaths that, sort  
18 of, pop up very quickly and, sort of, just, not -- not  
19 regularly breathing. Those are what we call agonal  
20 respirations or agonal breaths. Those are consistent,  
21 again, with a cardiac arrest because the body has --  
22 the heart's not beating, it's not getting any blood  
23 flow from the brain or to the heart and there's these,  
24 sort of -- these -- these, I guess, rudimentary extra  
25 breaths of the heart. They're like, sort of, little

1 guppy breaths in a sense. That's also all around the  
2 same time period.

3 So, that's why my opinion is that right  
4 around the time when the officer's asking about, you  
5 know, hey, are you okay? We saw the regurgitation,  
6 then you see shortly right after that, the agonal  
7 respirations. That's probably when the cardiac arrest  
8 occurred as a sudden event.

9 Q. Did -- were you able to determine whether or not  
10 the individuals who had their hands on Mr. Prude,  
11 based on your review, your knowledge base, the  
12 scientific literature, in this regard, whether the  
13 manner in which they held him, caused or contributed  
14 to that cardiac arrest?

15 A. I do have opinions on that, yes.

16 Q. Okay. Could you just go perhaps, like, officers'  
17 body part by body part?

18 A. Sure.

19 MS. SOMMERS: So, I didn't realize, I guess  
20 there's five minutes left in our meeting.

21 THE WITNESS: Okay.

22 MS. SOMMERS: We're going to have to --  
23 we're going to have to immediately do this. Do you  
24 want me to -- should I reschedule it right now and  
25 take -- I'm sorry. I didn't know that this was a time

1 limited thing. How about, I'm going to send you an  
2 invite and we'll get right back on. Okay?

3 THE WITNESS: Sounds perfect. Yep.

4 MS. SOMMERS: All right. Thank you.

5 THE WITNESS: I will be ready to go.

6 MS. SOMMERS: All right. I apologize.

7 Thank you.

8 MR. SMITH: For the record, ladies and  
9 gentlemen, we're just going to take a two minute  
10 adjournment here while we figure out this technical  
11 issue.

12 (Whereupon, there was a short break off the  
13 record.)

14 (Proceeding reconvened.)

15 MS. SOMMERS: What we're going to do --  
16 hold, please. We have to wait for one person to come  
17 back in the room. So, just -- we're almost -- thank  
18 you for your patience.

19 THE WITNESS: No problem.

20 MS. SOMMERS: All set?

21 MR. SMITH: We have one more.

22 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. Here we go.

23 MR. SMITH: Don't forget to record, Jen.

24 MS. SOMMERS: Just give me one moment. All  
25 right. Thank you. Okay. For the record, we are back

1 on the -- back with the recording. I apologize. We  
2 had to -- I didn't realize that we had to re-send a  
3 new invitation.

4 So, what I'm going to do at this point is  
5 ask the court reporter to read the last question --  
6 maybe the last answer and question that was asked,  
7 please.

8 (Whereupon, a read back was read into the  
9 record at page 89 lines 9 through 18.)

10 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. Were you able to hear  
11 that?

12 THE WITNESS: I was, yes.

13 BY MS. SOMMERS:

14 Q. All right. Could you -- could you explain your  
15 opinion relative to that question?

16 A. Sure. So, my opinion was -- let's start with the  
17 officer at the legs. Officer [REDACTED] was holding the  
18 ankles crossed and holding him in the calves. And,  
19 maybe just a quick background because it's going to --  
20 what drives my opinion is the -- what occurs with  
21 physiological weights. You -- in order, again, we  
22 talked about how to assess a case, how to review for  
23 possible ventilatory compromise. Where the weight is  
24 located is important. Weight on the torso, on the  
25 upper back, over the ribs. Those are things that we

1 want to look at that potentially may have some bearing  
2 on things. Weight on the lower back or buttocks  
3 doesn't impact ventilation. These have been studied,  
4 using studies looking at how much air you can breathe  
5 in and breathe out, how it affects your carbon dioxide  
6 levels and your oxygen levels. This has all been  
7 studied. And, so, weight on the lower back, buttocks  
8 and legs don't impact breathing. Our -- our breathing  
9 system is up here. So, from the perspective of that,  
10 sort of, you can immediately, sort of, say Officer  
11 [REDACTED] holding the legs down wasn't going to impact  
12 ventilations at all.

13 The other end of the body was the -- the  
14 head. The head was being held down. The head itself  
15 doesn't impact ventilations, right. The ventilations  
16 are done by the ribs opening and closing, by your  
17 diaphragm going up and down. That's what creates the  
18 movement of air. Holding one's head doesn't impact  
19 that unless, of course, you're blocking an airway but  
20 there wasn't evidence of that. You can hear speech,  
21 you could hear him talking. He was talking for almost  
22 a minute and a half, based on my review. At certain  
23 points, you can hear him groaning or moaning or we  
24 call it keeling at times, when he was in that  
25 position. So, we knew he was moving air through his

1 airway, through his mouth, through his trachea, down  
2 to his lungs because of the ability to communicate  
3 that way. So, we know air is going in and out. We  
4 also know that holding pressure on the head isn't  
5 going to impact the airway's ability to move air.  
6 It's a -- the skull is an affixed object, you're just  
7 holding pressure. In fact, I used to hold a lot of --  
8 a lot of patients before we had a good security force  
9 by the head because it really helps to control people,  
10 but it doesn't impact their ability to breathe.

11 Then, the third individual was Officer  
12 [REDACTED] was, I guess, on the lower back and there's  
13 some good images when you have some still frames on  
14 there, showing the back.

15 Q. Let me stop you for a minute. I'm going to hold  
16 up, for the camera, what has been marked for  
17 identification Grand Jury Exhibit Number 51. Are you  
18 able to see that?

19 A. I am, yes.

20 Q. Okay. Were those images something that you  
21 actually clipped from the video that you reviewed?

22 A. It looks like the images that I clipped, yes.

23 Q. Okay. And, does it look like a fair and accurate  
24 copy of the clip that you took from the video?

25 A. Yes, it does.

1 Q. Okay.

2 MS. SOMMERS: Can you possibly just put it  
3 up on the visualizer real quick? So, we're going to  
4 -- we're not going to be able to see you for a moment,  
5 but we're still going to talk here. So, up on the  
6 visualizer, the Grand Jury is able to see -- I'm  
7 sorry. I will move People's -- Grand Jury 51 into  
8 evidence and we'll mark it. And then, I will place it  
9 up onto the visualizer. And I --

10 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit 51 was then  
11 received into evidence.)

12 MS. SOMMERS: All right. So, you can't see,  
13 but very briefly we're putting it up there.

14 BY MS. SOMMERS:

15 Q. Do the photos that you chose exemplify what you  
16 were talking about in terms of the placement of  
17 Officer [REDACTED] leg relative to the back?

18 A. Correct, yes. This is a -- again, it's always a  
19 dynamic situation. People are moving and wiggling and  
20 things like that, but when you look at the totality of  
21 the video, this is where he -- we can look at  
22 different angles and things -- this is where he  
23 demonstrates his position. His knee is near the lower  
24 back portion. I think more importantly to look at on  
25 that picture is that the whole upper back is open.

1 You don't see any weight on the shoulders, you don't  
2 see any weight on the thoracic spine, the back spine  
3 or the ribs. And, I have reviewed a number -- a lot  
4 of these cases, and often, that's the challenge  
5 because often, there is pressure being put at the  
6 upper chest to put handcuffs placed or things like  
7 that. That wasn't the case here. In fact, there was  
8 no weight being placed over the ventilatory muscles,  
9 where you'd worry about that.

10 And, when I say worry about it, I worry  
11 about it when there are high amounts of weights for  
12 long periods of time, meaning we've put 225 pounds of  
13 lead on people's backs and kept it there for over four  
14 minutes. Nobody dies, they breathe well, they move  
15 oxygen levels well. It doesn't kill people. There's  
16 even evidence that, you know, even more weight than  
17 that is, I guess, safe. It doesn't cause ventilatory  
18 compromise, it doesn't cause you to asphyxiate, it  
19 doesn't cause you to not be able to breathe out. And,  
20 that's using real sensitive machines that can measure  
21 your ventilatory function. It's also measuring your  
22 carbon dioxide levels, your oxygen levels. So, it's  
23 got to be a lot of weight to even start thinking about  
24 whether it might impact or cause a cardiac event. The  
25 other case is it has to be there for a long period of

1 time. It takes four to five minutes to cause somebody  
2 to die from asphyxiation even with complete blockage.  
3 And, this comes from data from drowning and events  
4 where you get crushed by vending machines or cars, or  
5 even strangulation type of hanging videos and things  
6 like that. It takes four to five minutes with  
7 complete airway blockage to go into cardiac arrest.

8 This whole event, if you'd really just take  
9 the extreme ends of it, was less than two and a half  
10 minutes from where he was potentially put in this  
11 prone restraint position and when it looked like he  
12 had his cardiac arrest event. It's actually a little  
13 shorter than that, but that's sort of the -- the  
14 longitudinal aspect of it. So, with the timing of it,  
15 wasn't long enough to cause an asphyxial cardiac  
16 arrest. The weight on the back was with me. There  
17 wasn't anything that would impact his ventilation  
18 impact. A little bit of that arm lifting on the right  
19 side there by Officer [REDACTED] if there was any  
20 question about it, it would even make it easier for  
21 him to breathe. But the physiology is such that it  
22 doesn't impact.

23 And then, the event itself, the cardiac  
24 event was, he's talking, he's talking, we know he's  
25 moving air, so it's not even a complete airway

1 blockage at all, and then things change suddenly, he  
2 regurgitates and he's got agonal respirations. That  
3 is consistent with a sudden cardiac arrest. A heart  
4 stopping event, not asphyxiation or a ventilatory  
5 events.

6           So, all those things allow me to be able to  
7 be comfortable saying my opinion is that none of the  
8 officers, their impact, individually or collectively,  
9 would have caused or contributed to that cardiac  
10 arrest.

11           And, to go even one step further, if he had  
12 been allowed to get up and run around and sort of, be  
13 held in a position of being, you know, moving around  
14 in a group of police officers, that would actually be  
15 more detrimental than being held down. I think we've  
16 talked about that. The muscle groups that move around  
17 a lot are a problem for acidosis. Being held in this  
18 position, even though it restricts his movement and  
19 actually, is in some ways, in my mind, protective of  
20 him from himself and trying to reduce his acidosis.  
21 But, in no way did that position cause ventilatory  
22 issues.

23 Q. Did -- so, I just want to be clear. If -- if Mr.  
24 Prude had not -- if -- if -- if there had been no  
25 hands on and he had, kind of, remained sitting and had

1 not stood up, that would be a different story, if I  
2 understand you correctly?

3 A. Right. If he just sat there indian style and  
4 waited for the ambulance to come and treat him, that's  
5 different. He's not increasing any levels of that  
6 lactic acidosis. He's just sort of sitting there.  
7 So, yes, that would be a different scenario. If he  
8 got up and started to try to get away and they circled  
9 him and said just stay here, stay here, but didn't go  
10 hands on him, that activity level is actually worse  
11 for him than being held in a restraint position,  
12 limiting his activity.

13 Q. Okay. Once Mr. Prude became unresponsive, so  
14 once, sort of, using the vomiting as a -- as a  
15 temporal guide post, was the failure to turn him over,  
16 did that failure in any way cause or contribute to his  
17 ultimate death?

18 A. It did not.

19 Q. And, how -- what do you base that on?

20 A. At that point, he's already in cardiac arrest.  
21 So, his heart had already stopped. You're seeing the  
22 agonal respirations on his back a couple little blips  
23 there as they're trying to assess what -- what's going  
24 on with him, prior to the medic coming back.

25 The body itself, actually, being in the

1 prone position is, in a sense, it's fortuitous because  
2 you're on your back and you regurgitate up, you're  
3 likely to aspirate in your airways. Being on your  
4 stomach actually helps getting it out of your system  
5 and in a safer environment. But, the idea of whether  
6 they rolled him, immediately rolled him, you know,  
7 when they did, that was not going to change his  
8 ultimate outcome. He was already in cardiac arrest.  
9 He needed to be assessed, he needed to be checked to  
10 see if there was a pulse. All of those things. And  
11 then, in turn, start CPR, which is ultimately what  
12 they did.

13 Q. My last question. And, I -- this is really a  
14 little bit off topic but I -- because you brought up  
15 the -- you know, if somebody can speak, they can  
16 breathe. Oftentimes -- I know it's not applicable to  
17 this case but I just -- I wanted to breeze it only  
18 because it is possible for people to feel that they're  
19 having difficulty breathing and actually be having  
20 issues, and be able to speak, is that correct? I just  
21 want to make sure. I just wanted to kind of, cover  
22 that a little bit.

23 A. Sure. As an Emergency Physician, we see people  
24 come in with difficulty breathing and shortness of  
25 breath all the time. And, there are many different

1 ways it happens. Typically, those who have the  
2 biggest ventilatory problems, ones who truly can't  
3 breathe, they're not able to move air in and out of  
4 their lungs for lung disease, asthma, CHF, pneumonias,  
5 they're not speaking, they're not talking, that's when  
6 we get nervous. That's when we say, if you can't  
7 speak, we're -- we're anxious because you're so far  
8 down that ventilatory pathway that we're concerned.

9           There are certainly others that come in and  
10 say, I can't breathe, and they're breathing just fine.  
11 Their oxygen levels are normal, everything looks fine,  
12 but what they're having is a cardiac event. If you  
13 ever heard a friend or heard stories of the elephant  
14 on my chest, I can't breathe. It feels like there's  
15 something, you know, a ton of bricks on my chest.  
16 That's not a ventilatory problem. The lungs are  
17 working fine. Plenty of oxygen in your bloodstream.  
18 Everything's working great. It's the heart and the  
19 vessels of your heart that are the problem. So, the  
20 heart's not getting blood flow because of this  
21 blockage and it feels like you can't breathe because  
22 that cardiac ischemia, that cardiac event. The lungs  
23 are functioning. So, people can feel like they can't  
24 breathe and have absolutely normal lung function.  
25 Those who really can't breathe, typically don't talk.

1 And, if they do talk, they're certainly not talking  
2 over and over and over, they're talking in one or two  
3 words sentences, how we look at them.

4 Q. And, I know it's not directly a flip fold, I just  
5 wanted to make sure that everyone understood, like,  
6 when people say they can't breathe, they are  
7 experiencing -- it's obviously -- you might be  
8 experiencing something that feels to you, as a lay  
9 person, as if you can't breathe. That's all.

10 A. Right. It may not be a lung issue, it may be a  
11 heart issue. But, if you're -- the other end, if  
12 you're speaking and speaking and speaking from an ER  
13 doctor's evaluation, that is a -- that is a reassuring  
14 thing that we have a patent and a functional fairway  
15 of ventilations.

16 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. I do not have any  
17 further questions for Dr. [REDACTED], but I want to give  
18 the Grand Jury the opportunity. So, do any grand  
19 jurors have any questions? Yes, first over here?

20 A JUROR: I think I know the answer, but did  
21 you see anything in the video that you would recommend  
22 be done differently?

23 MS. SOMMERS: So, were you asked to evaluate  
24 the video to determine whether -- well, actually, I'll  
25 just go ahead and -- the grand juror has asked, upon

1 watching the video, is there anything that you would  
2 have done differently? And, are asking relative to  
3 the restraint?

4 A JUROR: That or the timing on the CPR.  
5 Anything that he saw that he would have liked to see  
6 differently?

7 THE WITNESS: Okay.

8 BY MS. SOMMERS:

9 Q. Sure. Is there anything upon watching that video  
10 that you feel could have been done better?

11 A. Sure. That's a great question. The Monday  
12 morning quarter backing. You can always, sort of, try  
13 and refine things, but in a global sense, you know,  
14 the officers were fortunate to be able to get him  
15 handcuffed relatively easy without a lot of struggle,  
16 which is great. They let him be in space. That was  
17 great. They just let him do -- when they thought he  
18 was going to get up, it would be in Mr. Prude's best  
19 interest not to do so from an activity level, from a  
20 obviously, law enforcement level, law enforcement  
21 safety perspective. But, to decide to hold him to a  
22 position that they did, very reasonable. Again,  
23 that's -- we're trained -- that's our swaddle way of  
24 keeping him from doing a lot of activity.

25 The way they held him, avoiding the

1 respiratory or ventilatory structures was -- was -- it  
2 would be textbook in my mind. They had the knees in  
3 the lower back, they had the legs restrained, as those  
4 can be a way to hurt people. And then, maintaining  
5 the head is a great way to keep people from getting up  
6 without it impacting them in any negative way,  
7 physiologically. The recognition. They actually did  
8 a good job because from his last vocalization to when  
9 they thought something may have changed and asked,  
10 hey, how you doing, was only a matter of seconds,  
11 like, 10 or 15 seconds. So, they recognized something  
12 changed very quickly. They saw the vomiting, they got  
13 the Paramedic back, they were looking for breathing.  
14 They saw those agonal breaths, which are hard to  
15 sometimes identify, but they recognized that.

16 And, ultimately, they turned him on his side  
17 and started CPR within less than two minutes. That  
18 may seem like a long time to people, that is a reality  
19 of what happens. That is EMS medicine, that is field  
20 medicine. That's the Emergency Department medicine.

21 We do have to do an assessment. Is there a  
22 pulse? Is there breathing? Get them in position.  
23 So, you know, I wouldn't do anything differently.  
24 It's all -- it's one of those, the medics got there,  
25 they're getting the meds drawn up by their protocols.

1 It takes time to do that, you know, could people run  
2 back and forth? I guess that's a possibility, but  
3 that's also not a true reality. It's -- we think time  
4 dependent but not seconds dependent.

5 So, again, that's my assessment. Overall,  
6 the management was good as you're going to be able to  
7 get under the circumstances that were there. The  
8 timing, the availability of the individuals coming in.

9 Q. What about having a protocol, where if -- if a  
10 call comes out that someone's naked and bleeding and  
11 having kind of those sedatives right on hand  
12 immediately?

13 A. Well, you know, it's interesting, right? So,  
14 even if they -- the Paramedic had to run to the  
15 ambulance to get the sedatives and have them in  
16 hand -- you know, these are controlled substances, so  
17 nobody keeps them in hand. They can't load them in  
18 your pockets. You have to have them locked up and  
19 safe for many reasons, from a DEA perspective. But,  
20 even if they ran to get the medications and came back,  
21 the medic still has to do a quick assessment and make  
22 sure that they have a good, strong pulse before you  
23 start putting medications in them.

24 So, even though there are things, you have  
25 to do a quick assessments and make sure things are

1     okay.  There was no way that Paramedic wasn't going to  
2     be able to get the meds on board him before he had his  
3     cardiac arrest.  That's -- you know, they came over  
4     and saw, went to the ambulance, you know, the cadence  
5     was the cadence.  But, even if you optimize things,  
6     you have to go unlock it, get it, do -- come back and  
7     do an assessment.  You don't give medicine without  
8     checking somebody's heart rate and try to get a blood  
9     pressure, if you can, in general, and then you give  
10    the medications for various reasons.  Obviously, we  
11    don't want to give calming medicines to somebody who's  
12    got a low blood pressure or who has got a real thready  
13    pulse even though they are agitated.  We have to  
14    assess that.  So, the protocols -- there's different  
15    protocols across the country and different ways of  
16    using it, we're trying to be safe.  We want to protect  
17    individuals like this and try to get them treatment as  
18    fast as possible.  On the other end of the coin, we  
19    don't want to both reuse it and cause harm to people  
20    that didn't meet the criteria and didn't have the  
21    appropriate evaluations.

22                   MS. SOMMERS:  Yes, [REDACTED]?

23                   A JUROR:  In reviewing the Medical  
24    Examiner's report, does he have an opinion in  
25    agreement with the Medical Examiner saying that

1 homicide was part of the cause of death?

2 BY MS. SOMMERS:

3 Q. In New York State, Medicals Examiners are  
4 required to put a manner of death, not just the cause  
5 of death. And, the Medical Examiner who previously  
6 testified, indicated that she determined a homicide  
7 since the death occurred at the hands of another. She  
8 also -- and, I don't want to mis-state anything, I  
9 believe, indicated that she was not determining  
10 whether it was legally justified -- not justified, or  
11 whatever. In California, where you are, first of all,  
12 are you a Medical Examiner?

13 A. I am not a Medical Examiner.

14 Q. Okay. Actually, are you a -- are you -- do you  
15 have any pathology training or certification?

16 A. I don't have any certifications. I get general  
17 training, but nothing specific.

18 Q. Okay. And, are you aware of whether or not in  
19 the State of California, Medical Examiner reports  
20 require the same designation as to manner -- cause and  
21 manner of death?

22 A. So, I'm not a Medical Examiner. I don't -- I do  
23 write cause of death. I do fill out death  
24 certificates. I don't do a manner of death. That is  
25 a Medical Examiner's specific area. I've reviewed

1 hundreds of autopsies in cases and there is a  
2 challenge on that manner of death. And, this is  
3 country wide, not just New York or California, at the  
4 hands of another, meaning if somebody was holding on  
5 or doing something, there is disagreement amongst  
6 their own speciality about whether it should be  
7 natural, whether it should be accidental or whether it  
8 should be homicide. And, if you ask three Medical  
9 Examiners on the same case, you may get three  
10 different answers. So, it's difficult. But, I think  
11 the important piece you brought up there, this isn't  
12 the determination of causation, this isn't a  
13 determination of legal something. This is, basically,  
14 the hands are on when it happened, they -- they  
15 consider it a homicide and it's what it is. If I'm  
16 holding somebody during a cardiac arrest in a heart  
17 attack and I'm doing something with them, they will  
18 consider that a homicide because my hands are on them  
19 during that time in some cases, and others will not.  
20 So, it's very varied from Medical Examiner to Medical  
21 Examiner.

22 MS. SOMMERS: All right. I'm going to leave  
23 that one there. Any other questions? Yes, [REDACTED]?

24 A JUROR: He said the cause of death was  
25 excited delirium and he had -- his heart had stopped

1 at that point, you mean, the AED would not have done  
2 anything?

3 MS. SOMMERS: So, this is -- one of the --  
4 thank you.

5 BY MS. SOMMERS:

6 Q. One of the grand jurors -- so, first of all, is  
7 the -- was the actual cause of death excited delirium  
8 or cardiac arrest generated by excited delirium?  
9 Could you just first of all clarify that?

10 A. Sure. It would be PCP induced excited delirium,  
11 leading to cardiac arrest.

12 Q. Okay. And, one of the grand jurors asked if --  
13 what about an AED being administered quickly, more  
14 quickly? I understand, you know, Monday morning  
15 quarter backing, but one of the grand jurors has asked  
16 about that?

17 A. Great question. AEDs are automatic -- automatic  
18 external defibrillators are designed to defibrillate.  
19 So, if you're in a shockable rhythm, like, ventricular  
20 fibrillation, a little wiggly thing that goes across  
21 that you sometimes see on TV shows, that's the kind  
22 that you can shock. Mr. Prude was not in ventricular  
23 fibrillation. So, an AED would not have shocked him.  
24 It would not have had any impact on his outcome. They  
25 would have done an assessment, set his hands off,

1 wait, non-shockable or no shock indicated, hands back  
2 on for CPR. So, in his case, it wouldn't have made a  
3 difference at all.

4 Q. Is that what you were referring to previously as  
5 pulseless electrical activity?

6 A. That was the rhythm he was found to be in and  
7 that is not a shockable rhythm and that's very common  
8 in these excited delirium cases.

9 Q. Thank you.

10 MS. SOMMERS: Yes, [REDACTED]

11 A JUROR: So, what -- question about, aside  
12 from the term homicide, were there any -- is his  
13 findings conclusive with the Medical Examiner or were  
14 there some differences in opinion?

15 BY MS. SOMMERS:

16 Q. Okay. So, one of the grand jurors has asked,  
17 other than, you know, whether -- and, about -- with  
18 the understanding that you're not determining manners  
19 of death, and with the understanding, that the Medical  
20 Examiner who testified, indicated that the death --  
21 that her definition of asphyxia was, I -- I submit or  
22 I believe; and, again, I want to make sure that the  
23 Grand Jury agrees, was a lack of oxygen, available  
24 oxygen? Other -- so, with that as an understanding,  
25 do you agree with the actual physical -- with the

1 findings of the Medical Examiner?

2 A. I'd have to look at the exact wording that they  
3 had. I don't remember the exact wording.

4 Q. Complications of asphyxia -- complications of  
5 asphyxia and, for the record, I'm reading from  
6 admitted Exhibit 36-A. Complications of asphyxia in  
7 the setting of physical restraint was finding number  
8 one. Finding two was excited delirium. Finding three  
9 was acute phencyclidine intoxication. And then,  
10 finding four was a post donor -- post organ donor  
11 indication.

12 A. So, obviously, the phencyclidine intoxication,  
13 yes. The excited delirium, yes. And, if the Medical  
14 Examiner, again, explained that the issues with the  
15 patient or the subject was restraint, we know that.  
16 But, the asphyxia or the complications of asphyxia was  
17 not because of the restraint, but rather because of  
18 the cardiac arrest and lack of flow, then  
19 physiologically, I'd be agreeing. I probably would  
20 word it differently. But, if they are saying that the  
21 position caused asphyxia, that's what their testimony  
22 was, that position caused asphyxiation, then I'd,  
23 obviously, would be disagreeing.

24 MS SOMMERS: Does that answer your question?

25 A JUROR: Yes.

1 MS. SOMMERS: Any other questions? Yes?

2 A JUROR: Can you ask if there's a way to  
3 measure lactic acidosis built up, either at the  
4 hospital or possibly afterwards?

5 BY MS. SOMMERS:

6 Q. Sure. A grand juror asked if -- if there was a  
7 way to determine if there was actually a high acid  
8 level when an individual presents at the Emergency  
9 Room; are you able to do that?

10 A. Lactaid levels can be measured. Or pHs can be  
11 checked. But, after cardiac arrest, it often throws  
12 off those numbers. So, which means, you know,  
13 somebody comes in with a low pH after having had chest  
14 compressions or cardiac arrest, it could be in part  
15 due to the acid levels from what occurred previously,  
16 or it could be due to the fact that they were in  
17 cardiac arrest. So, it does -- there's things to  
18 measure, but it's not always able to point exactly  
19 what the cause was.

20 MS. SOMMERS: Anyone else? Oh, yes, I'm  
21 sorry. I apologize.

22 A JUROR: After reviewing the body cam  
23 footage, at approximately 3:20 a.m., Daniel is being  
24 restrained and he's -- there's a distinctive point  
25 where he's speaking and then all of a sudden his voice

1 becomes muffled. In your medical perspective, what do  
2 you think is the best explanation for that?

3

4 BY MS. SOMMERS:

5 Q. So, were you able to hear the question asked?

6 A. I believe I've got most it.

7 Q. Do you have an opinion as to why his voice  
8 becomes muffled?

9 A. Yeah. That can be for a number of things.  
10 That's a good question as well. Clearly, he's more  
11 clear initially. Sometimes they adjust their face and  
12 it goes down a little bit more and, sort of, can  
13 muffle it, you know, from that perspective. Sometimes  
14 they get fatigued. Sometimes they do what we call  
15 keening, which is just making sounds that aren't  
16 really words and you're not trying to articulate  
17 something but you're more groaning type of thing. So,  
18 something along those lines.

19 I can't say specifically what it was. But,  
20 what I do recognize that -- that there is air movement  
21 going in and out, to continue to do that. But, you're  
22 right, there was a change in there. I suspect it's  
23 probably more of a slight position change or a little  
24 bit of lack of effort.

25 Q. But, you're not able to -- to say, kind of, with

1 that sort of certainty, or you're not really offering  
2 an opinion on that? You're not really able to say?

3 A. I can -- I feel comfortable saying that I don't  
4 -- there's no evidence that there was an obstructed  
5 airway as far as that goes. He's still moving air in  
6 and out. He's still moving making sounds. But, why  
7 the phonation change? It could be a number of things.  
8 But, none of them would have blocked the way to  
9 ventilate.

10 MS. SOMMERS: Does that answer the question?

11 A JUROR: Yes.

12 MS. SOMMERS: Any other questions?

13 Dr. [REDACTED], thank you very much. Very much appreciate  
14 it. And, you are officially done with Grand Jury.  
15 Thank you.

16 THE WITNESS: Thank you all for your  
17 service. Be safe.

18 (Whereupon, the witnessed was excused at a  
19 time of 1:16 p.m.)

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 MS. SOMMERS: So, before you go for your  
2 lunch here, real quick, I want to say a few things.  
3 So, a couple things. I didn't want to interrupt  
4 because of the times here, but Dr. [REDACTED] said some  
5 things that I really think are more your province and  
6 not his. Particularly to when he asked about whether  
7 things could have been done differently.

8 So, he was called as an expert in terms of  
9 causation. And, that's why we submitted that to you.  
10 But, when -- when -- and, I completely understand the  
11 question. And, you know, when it comes to, you know,  
12 if things could have been done differently, that's not  
13 why he was brought in. He was not asked to evaluate  
14 in that regard. He was brought in as an expert in  
15 restraint related deaths and causations.

16 So, I want to make clear that you -- it's  
17 your opinion if -- if ultimately asked to, kind of,  
18 weigh anything in that regard.

19 I also wanted to mention that in Dr.  
20 [REDACTED] testimony, we can also have read back to you  
21 if necessary, only because one of the questions  
22 elicited from Dr. [REDACTED] sort of, a response that, I  
23 think, where he could almost be read to characterize  
24 her testimony. Again, she testified. Her testimony  
25 speaks for itself.

1           And then, at one point in describing Mr. --  
2           or the principle of excited delirium, Dr. [REDACTED]  
3           indicated that the literature said that it was more an  
4           issue that is seen in chronic users as opposed to a  
5           first time user. Just advising that you are not to,  
6           kind of, draw negative conclusions based upon that  
7           fact alone. Okay. So, I just wanted to kind of put  
8           all of that out there.

9           With that said, I know it's been a very long  
10          morning. It's 1:18. How about we reconvene --

11          A JUROR: But the EMT is coming back  
12          at 1:30.

13          MS. SOMMERS: Yeah, I know. Did I say 1:30  
14          or 1:45. Is she out there? Why don't we bring her --

15          A JUROR: I'm curious as to why the Medical  
16          Examiner put the main cause of death as asphyxiation.

17          MS. SOMMERS: So, again, her -- her  
18          testimony speaks for itself. We can reread it if --  
19          we can have it reread to you if you'd like.

20          A JUROR: I think she needs to be called in  
21          again.

22          MS. SOMMERS: So, I submit that she  
23          explained what her -- what she meant by asphyxiation  
24          and I don't want to mis-state what she said. And, I  
25          also -- that's why I'm cautious about kind of asking

1 another witness to characterize it and I want to  
2 mention it.

3 MR. SMITH: I do think the transcript or  
4 review of the transcript --

5 MS. SOMMERS: Yeah. We can very, very  
6 easily have any part of that reread.

7 A JUROR: Are you trying to say they have a  
8 difference of opinion and we're here to figure out  
9 which one? I mean --

10 A JUROR: I don't think it was a difference  
11 of opinion.

12 MR. SMITH: To the extent to which their  
13 opinions even differ, I think, again, it is explained  
14 or clear in the words of the testimony. And again,  
15 that can be read back at any time. But, you are the  
16 arbitrators of the facts, not us. So, your  
17 recollection controls, and you are the ones that make  
18 those decisions. And again, transcripts are there to  
19 be reviewed. But, I would submit that both Dr. [REDACTED]  
20 and Dr. [REDACTED] were asked their conclusions and asked  
21 to explain them. So, I just -- again, we are not your  
22 legal advisors -- or, we are your legal advisors, but  
23 we are not determining the facts. That's for you to  
24 decide whether or not they're in disagreement in the  
25 first place, it's up to you how to resolve it.

1 MS. SOMMERS: If -- if [REDACTED] is right  
2 outside, we could bring her back, finish her  
3 questioning, and then take the break and that might be  
4 more appropriate.

5 A JUROR: [REDACTED] may I make a suggestion?

6 MS. SOMMERS: Of course.

7 A JUROR: Maybe we can ask you the questions  
8 before she comes in. That way, we can --

9 MS. SOMMERS: You know what, that's actually  
10 a great idea.

11 A JUROR: [REDACTED] been patiently waiting and  
12 I don't want to make her wait another hour.

13 MS. SOMMERS: [REDACTED], could you peak  
14 your head out and just tell Mike to hold [REDACTED] outside  
15 for a moment?

16 So, what we're going to do is people -- the  
17 remaining people that had questions for [REDACTED] Why  
18 don't you ask them now. I'll kind of write them down  
19 and then I'll ask her. So, who had questions that had  
20 not been answered? I know there were.

21 A JUROR: The question for the witness is,  
22 if she arrives on site and notes or witnesses an  
23 issue, does she have the authority to say anything?

24 MS. SOMMERS: To the police?

25 A JUROR: Just in general. Yeah, because it

1 was regarding restraining. If she sees anything that  
2 looks like it can be causing the patient distress,  
3 does she have the authority to say something and if  
4 she does, as a follow-up question, did you see  
5 anything on site that looked a little off and do you  
6 wish you would have said something?

7 MS. SOMMERS: Yeah, I can definitely ask  
8 that. So, that's of course a different question than  
9 whether the people that she is asking to do things, to  
10 listen to her. But, is there anything precluding her  
11 from saying anything?

12 A JUROR: When she arrived on site, does she  
13 take charge essentially, based on the patient's  
14 condition probably the most important thing.

15 MS. SOMMERS: Understood.

16 A JUROR: Don't know if you have to write  
17 this down.

18 MS. SOMMERS: Believe me, I do.

19 A JUROR: Her Supervisor was called and  
20 asked about using the ketamine. Did she give an  
21 answer on how long it would take the Supervisor to get  
22 there?

23 MS. SOMMERS: Okay.

24 A JUROR: I have a follow-up question to her  
25 now that it just jogged my memory. She was talking

1 about how she had two vials. She was just loading up  
2 the second vial. It wasn't clear to me whether any  
3 sedative was administered.

4 A JUROR: It was not.

5 MS. SOMMERS: Well, let's ask her.

6 A JUROR: She said so.

7 A JUROR: Okay. Fine.

8 MS. SOMMERS: Are you okay with that?

9 A JUROR: That's fine.

10 MS. SOMMERS: Anyone else? All right.

11 Let's bring her in.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1                   (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
2 Jury room at a time of 1:24 p.m.)

3

4                   [REDACTED] [REDACTED] after having been  
5 previously called and duly sworn testified further as  
6 follows:

7

8

**EXAMINATION BY MS. SOMMERS:**

9 Q. For the record, we have recalled [REDACTED]  
10 following the testimony of Dr. [REDACTED]  
11 just recall that you're still under oath.

12 A. I am.

13 Q. So, [REDACTED], just a couple of questions from  
14 the grand jurors. If you arrive on a scene, is there  
15 anything prohibiting you from indicating when you see  
16 things that are not up to your, what you believe  
17 should be done?

18 A. Not necessarily, no. Unless it's a safety  
19 concern for myself.

20 Q. Okay. When you arrived on scene, did you see  
21 anything that you did not approve of?

22 A. The position that he was being held in was not  
23 ideal, but from my vantage point, it was not  
24 necessarily a concern that needed to immediately be  
25 addressed.

1 Q. If it was a concern that you felt immediately  
2 needed to be addressed, did you have the authority to  
3 say something?

4 A. I could have said something. I have no authority  
5 to force them to listen.

6 Q. Okay. In any event, did you saying anything?

7 A. I did not.

8 Q. In terms of contacting your Supervisor in order  
9 to get ketamine on scene, did you get any indication  
10 as to how long that was going to take?

11 A. While I was on the phone with her, she indicated  
12 that she was probably about a minute to two minutes  
13 out from my location at that time.

14 Q. And, what happened while you were on the phone  
15 with her?

16 A. At that point, my partner called over and said he  
17 needed my help and I ended the conversation and hung  
18 up.

19 Q. So, it was at the point where your partner -- and  
20 I believe you said his name was [REDACTED] ?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. It was at the point that he called you over that  
23 you were on the phone with your Supervisor?

24 A. I had been on the phone for the minute before  
25 that, yes.

1 Q. Okay. So you had been on the phone with her, and  
2 were you still on the phone with her?

3 A. I was still on the phone with her.

4 Q. And, what, if anything, did you indicate when  
5 your partner called you over?

6 A. I don't remember my exact words. I believe it  
7 was something along the lines of, we may have a  
8 cardiac arrest and I hung up.

9 Q. Okay. Is a cardiac arrest in the EMS or the  
10 pre-hospital care universe known by a number?

11 A. Medical 5 or surgical 5.

12 Q. Is it also ever known as 500?

13 A. Yes.

14 MS. SOMMERS: Did I answer your question?

15 Do any grand jurors have any follow-up questions based  
16 on that?

17 A JUROR: What concern might there have been  
18 about the position that he was in?

19 THE WITNESS: We don't like to hold an  
20 excited delirium patient's face down. It's not ideal.  
21 It can sometimes restrict them taking those deep  
22 breaths. But, when I first walked up, it appeared he  
23 was still able to move around, so it was not an  
24 immediate concern.

25 MS. SOMMERS: Does that answer the

1 questions?

2 A JUROR: Absolutely.

3 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you. Anyone else?

4 A JUROR: At the point where he was vomiting  
5 up liquids, was that the point where they decided that  
6 it would do no good to do anything else because the  
7 heart has stopped?

8 MS. SOMMERS: So, let me stop you for a  
9 moment because I'm not sure if this witness --

10 A JUROR: I'm sorry.

11 MS. SOMMERS: No, no. You're fine.

12 BY MS. SOMMERS:

13 Q. So, let me ask you this. Were you present at the  
14 time that Mr. Prude vomited?

15 A. I was not. It was, I believe, just after that my  
16 partner called me. I was not made aware of that until  
17 later on in the call.

18 Q. So, you were not present at that moment?

19 A. I was not.

20 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. Does that answer your  
21 question?

22 A JUROR: Yes.

23 MS. SOMMERS: Any others?

24 GRAND JURY POOL: (All jurors indicating a  
25 negative response.)

1 MS. SOMMERS: All right. Thank you. I  
2 apologize that you had to wait. Thank you.

3 THE WITNESS: That's okay.

4 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you. You're all set.

5 (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
6 room at a time of 1:29 p.m.)

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 MS. SOMMERS: So, it's 1:30. How about --  
2 do you want to say -- 2:00 o'clock would be great.  
3 And, we can then just finish. I think we have two  
4 witnesses left. So, if you could get back at 2:00.  
5 We won't be here until 5:00. That would be great.  
6 Thank you.

7 (Whereupon, the Grand Jury broke for lunch.)

8 (Proceeding reconvened.)

9 MR. SMITH: Ladies and gentlemen, we have  
10 two witnesses left this afternoon. Ladies and  
11 gentlemen, hopefully they go quick. We're going to  
12 call [REDACTED].

13 MS. SOMMERS: All set?

14 MR. SMITH: Yes.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1                   (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
2 Jury room at a time of 2:03 p.m.)

3

4                   [REDACTED]      [REDACTED] after being duly  
5 called and sworn, testified as follows:

6

7

**EXAMINATION BY MR. SMITH:**

8 Q.    Good afternoon, sir.

9 A.    Hello.

10 Q.    Could you state and spell your first and last  
11 names for the record, please?

12 A.    I am [REDACTED]

13 Q.    Are you currently employed, Mr. [REDACTED]

14 A.    I am not. I'm a full time graduate student.

15 Q.    Where are you a graduate student?

16 A.    Quinnipiac University.

17 Q.    Where is that, sir?

18 A.    It's in -- my campus is in North Capen,  
19 Connecticut.

20 Q.    What kind of program is it?

21 A.    It's a physician's assistant program, Masters  
22 Degree.

23 Q.    Congratulations, sir. Prior to physician's  
24 assistant school, were you employed?

25 A.    I was.

1 Q. Where were you employed, sir?

2 A. AMR Ambulance.

3 Q. Where were you employed by AMR Ambulance?

4 A. Rochester, New York.

5 Q. What was the timeframe you worked for AMR?

6 A. August 2018 to April 2020.

7 Q. What was your position at AMR, Mr. [REDACTED]

8 A. I was an emergency medical technician.

9 Q. Could you just briefly describe for the Grand  
10 Jury, please, sir, the grand jurors, what an emergency  
11 medical technician is?

12 A. So, it's a first responder position. You're  
13 trained to administer life saving interventions, basic  
14 life saving interventions, that are not overly  
15 invasive in an attempt to help people in an acute  
16 emergency event, all the way down to more non-emergent  
17 events as well, to bring people to the hospital safe.

18 Q. And, Mr. [REDACTED] what's the level of education or  
19 specific training that you have that you need to  
20 become an EMT?

21 A. So, it's like a course, the way I took it was, it  
22 was a three month course over the summer that involved  
23 going to class four -- four days a week for about four  
24 hours each class session. Then, you had to take a  
25 clinical skills exam, as well as a book type of exam,

1     like a standard exam.

2     Q.    And, you passed all that?

3     A.    Yes.

4     Q.    Did you work as an EMT anyplace else besides AMR?

5     A.    I did.  I had -- initially, I was hired to a  
6     small private ambulance company in Central New York,  
7     in Rome, New York.  That's where I first worked as an  
8     EMT.  I also worked as an EMT at my undergraduate  
9     university, at St. Lawrence University, way up north  
10    near Canada.  So, I had a little previous experience  
11    there.  And then, I became the EMT at AMR.

12    Q.    So, how many years total did you have as an EMT  
13    before school, Mr. [REDACTED]

14    A.    Before I left, I had about three and a half  
15    years.

16    Q.    I'm drawing your attention to March 23rd of this  
17    year, 2020, Mr. [REDACTED].  Were you working as an EMT  
18    for AMR on that date?

19    A.    Yes.

20    Q.    Do you recall what shift you were working on that  
21    day?

22    A.    I worked 5:30 p.m. to 5:30 a.m.

23    Q.    Were you working with anybody?

24    A.    Yes, I had a partner.

25    Q.    Who was your partner?

1 A. [REDACTED].

2 Q. Is [REDACTED] an EMT?

3 A. She is a Paramedic.

4 Q. And, the grand jurors got some testimony, Mr.

5 [REDACTED], but can you just briefly describe the

6 difference between an EMT and a Paramedic and the

7 different levels of care?

8 A. Yeah. So, an EMT naturally, is a basic life

9 support provider. A Paramedic is an advanced life

10 support provider. So, when I do more life saving

11 interventions, it's very non-invasive or as least

12 invasive as it can be. Paramedics do much more

13 invasive things. Their learning is a lot longer than

14 what an EMT is and their, kind of, gauge of what they

15 can do in an acute emergency is much wider than mine.

16 Q. So, Ms. [REDACTED] is at a higher level of care than  
17 you are?

18 A. Correct.

19 Q. And, as an EMT, Mr. [REDACTED], are you able to  
20 perform CPR?

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. Chest compressions?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Are you able to administer sedatives?

25 A. No.

1 Q. I want to direct your attention to around 3:00  
2 a.m., a little after 3:00 a.m., Mr. [REDACTED] again, on  
3 March 23rd, 2020. Did you receive a dispatch  
4 directing you to the vicinity of 435 Jefferson Avenue  
5 in the City of Rochester?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. How were you made aware of that dispatch, sir?

8 A. It came in over the radio. It's standard that  
9 dispatch gets the 911 call. They code it, and then  
10 they dispatch the ambulance that is closest to that  
11 call. We were the closest ambulance, so they called  
12 our rig number. We responded. They said, go to XYZ  
13 address for this call.

14 Q. What was the nature of that call, Mr. [REDACTED] if  
15 you recall?

16 A. It was a psychiatric call.

17 Q. Is a psychiatric call a common call for an AMR  
18 EMT crew in the City of Rochester?

19 A. Extremely common, yes.

20 Q. What does that mean to you as an EMT when you get  
21 that call?

22 A. When you hear that, your idea of what's going on  
23 is still very broad. Dispatch information isn't  
24 always spot on and what's happening on the scene is  
25 not always directly correlating to what the patient's

1 condition is. So, you always take the information  
2 with a grain of salt. But, when you hear a  
3 psychiatric event, you know, you prepare yourself for  
4 the types of calls in which someone's in more of a  
5 mental or emotional distress, and less of a physical  
6 distress. Some of those things, you know, overlap a  
7 bit, if it's, you know, something like a suicide  
8 attempt or things of that nature. But, your mind  
9 shifts away from the harder more intervention driven  
10 medicine, such as like, a heart attack or trouble  
11 breathing call. So, you kind of paint the picture to  
12 be ready to respond to someone who's in some distress  
13 or is emotional.

14 Q. Is it fairly common, sir, that one of these types  
15 of calls, as a psych call, when you respond, you end  
16 up transporting the patient to the hospital?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. Where were you when you received this dispatch?

19 A. We were on the west side of the City. I can't  
20 remember exactly where we were, whether or not we were  
21 at a post or if we were actually driving somewhere to  
22 a post. But, I remember we were, kind of, heading  
23 south on the west side of the City.

24 Q. Now, did you respond directly to 435 Jefferson  
25 Avenue or did you stage?

1 A. We staged beforehand.

2 Q. Where did you stage?

3 A. We staged just north of Main Street, like,  
4 literally, probably two blocks away from the call,  
5 which is pretty standard practice for any kind of  
6 psychiatric caller or any kind of a call of that  
7 nature.

8 Q. Why is that, Mr. [REDACTED]

9 A. It's mostly for our own protection. To make sure  
10 that the police are there, have the scene under  
11 control before we go in.

12 Q. Eventually, were you cleared to enter the scene?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. Did you then proceed to the area of 435  
15 Jefferson?

16 A. Yes.

17 Q. From where you were to 435 Jefferson Avenue, Mr.  
18 [REDACTED] how long did it take to get there?

19 A. I would say no more than three minutes.

20 Q. From the time you initially got that dispatch,  
21 from the time you initially arrived on scene, was that  
22 call updated at all, did you receive any additional  
23 information?

24 A. When we get dispatched for things, we get the  
25 notes that the dispatchers get, and that gets sent to

1 a phone that's part of our equipment on the ambulance.  
2 And, in some of those notes, there's sometimes things  
3 of -- of, you know, noteworthy there, and it did, you  
4 know, say that there was a naked, bloody man on the  
5 ground.

6 Q. Did you draw any conclusions when you heard that  
7 updated information, Mr. [REDACTED]

8 A. Again, you kind of have to take everything with a  
9 grain of salt because you're not there yet. You can  
10 play around with the idea of well, why is this  
11 happening or why is this occurring, and you absolutely  
12 should do that, but you also still have to be prepared  
13 for, you know, anything else to happen. You know, you  
14 can only speculate so much. But, to be told that  
15 there's someone naked and bloody on the ground, you  
16 know, your mind immediately starts asking the  
17 questions, well, why is someone in that position and  
18 what is -- what is making someone to be in that type  
19 of position.

20 Q. So, based on that information that you and Ms.  
21 [REDACTED] received, Mr. [REDACTED], did you two, sort of, on  
22 the way over to 435 Jefferson Avenue; or, before you  
23 exited the ambulance, was there any kind of plan of  
24 who was going do to what discussed? Or, what was the  
25 plan?

1 A. [REDACTED] and I work very well together and that's  
2 why I've worked with her for so long. I actually  
3 chose to only work with her when I could have worked  
4 with many other people, but I only felt comfortable  
5 working with her. And, because we worked so well  
6 together, there wasn't always a lot of need for overt  
7 communications. We both understood what our roles  
8 were going from call to call. It was always very  
9 clear, you know, she has, you know, final say over  
10 things, as she should. And, I'm there to help her  
11 with anything that she needs going from it. In a call  
12 like this, that could go -- because a Paramedic  
13 doesn't always take the call, if the call is not  
14 requiring of advanced life support interventions, then  
15 the EMT can take the call.

16 A psychiatric event is one of those calls  
17 that can go either way. Calls that cannot go either  
18 way are calls like cardiac events. So, if you get  
19 called for someone whose heart rate is 150, that's  
20 always going to be the Paramedic's job to handle that  
21 because they are at a higher level of care that can  
22 deal with that. That, I will never be able to deal  
23 with.

24 But, for psych calls, going into it, you  
25 always know it can either be a BLS or an ALS call.

1 And then, what you find on the scene determines what  
2 level of care they need. So, going into it, we both  
3 understood, you know, it could be BLS, it could be  
4 ALS, depending on what the nature of the call is.  
5 But, you never assume that, hey, this is always, you  
6 know, a BLS providers action. But -- so, we  
7 understood that.

8           When we get on scene we have to determine  
9 that and we have to gauge the situation. And, so was  
10 there overt conversation being had if -- hey, if it's  
11 X then I'll take it and if it's, you know, Y, I'll  
12 take it no, because we both have a pretty good  
13 understanding of this is ALS criteria and this is BLS  
14 criteria, and we know who can handle what.

15           So, there's not ever -- there's questions in  
16 terms of why is this individual naked in the street  
17 when it's cold out. That's a question that you always  
18 ask, you know, to the crowd. But, there's a very  
19 limited amount of true pre planning that you can do.

20 Q. I don't want to put words in your mouth, Mr.

21 ████████ but, it's fair to say then, sort of, pending  
22 on the situation at the scene and the evaluation of  
23 the patient, there's not a specific plan?

24 A. Yeah. You come in very broad and able to handle,  
25 kind of, everything. You rule out life threats, you

1 address life threats and then you dictate care from  
2 there.

3 Q. Did there come a point then, sir, that you  
4 arrived on the scene at 435 Jefferson Avenue?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. Did you make any observations when you arrived at  
7 that location?

8 A. Yeah. So, pulling up to the scene, it caught my  
9 eye, the level of police presence that -- you know,  
10 just seeing the number of police cars there.

11 Q. Do you recall how many cars you saw?

12 A. I would say at least four or five.

13 Q. Was that unusual to you, sir, on a psych call?

14 A. It's not unusual but it tells me that something  
15 is happening. Something is requiring more than a few  
16 officers to be there. Because for a cooperative  
17 psychiatric call, someone who needs to go to the  
18 hospital who needs help, is not resisting in any kind  
19 of way, there wouldn't be a true need to have more  
20 than two or three officers.

21 Q. Did you see any police officers outside of their  
22 patrol cars at that scene?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. How many?

25 A. I saw at least five, I believe.

1 Q. Did you see a patient?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Where was the patient located?

4 A. So, the patient was in a prone position with his  
5 hands restrained behind his back with -- with  
6 handcuffs. This was another thing that -- that stuck  
7 out to me was the way -- way that the officers were  
8 restraining him. Working in Rochester, I've seen many  
9 individuals being restrained, but I've never quite  
10 seen somebody be restrained in this manner.

11 Q. What -- in what way was it different, Mr. [REDACTED]

12 A. There was one officer who -- who seemed to be,  
13 kind of, like tri-podding on the patient's, you know,  
14 neck and head. I had never seen that before. I had  
15 no idea police were allowed to do that or anything of  
16 that nature. And, as I said, I've seen multiple  
17 people being restrained, but never seen someone, I  
18 guess, who needed that level of restraint to that  
19 patient.

20 Q. Let me ask you this, Mr. [REDACTED] are you familiar  
21 or aware of the Rochester Police training techniques?

22 A. I am generally aware. I'm not aware of the  
23 specific techniques or training. But, I've seen, in  
24 general, some of their techniques being done.

25 Q. How many officers were hands on with this

1 patient?

2 A. I believe at least three.

3 Q. And, where were they located?

4 A. One was towards the head. There was another one  
5 on the back torso. And then, I believe, one on the  
6 legs.

7 Q. The thing that you just described that you hadn't  
8 seen before, where was that being done and by whom,  
9 which officer, where was he located?

10 A. He was towards the head. So, it quite literally  
11 looked like he was, you know, kind of, bracing with  
12 his back legs and taking his other two hands and  
13 really supporting most of his weight on the -- on the  
14 back of the patient's head and he was shaded towards  
15 the -- the front of the -- the patient towards the  
16 head of the patient.

17 Q. You said previously, the head and neck. So, I  
18 want to be clear, if you can tell us, tell the Grand  
19 Jury, if you saw that officer's hands, sort of, near  
20 the neck or if they were on the head?

21 A. I could not differentiate if it was on the head  
22 or if it was on the neck. I just could see that it  
23 was near that -- that area. And, I could -- I could  
24 tell that there was some amount of force being put  
25 either on the neck or on the back of the head.

1 Q. Could you tell how much force was being used?

2 A. I couldn't. I mean, I know you could stand on  
3 your legs and just put a little bit of pressure or you  
4 could put your entire body weight. But, from the way  
5 he was positioned and how I was seeing it, I don't  
6 think I could ever tell how much pressure.

7 Q. And, at that point, Mr. [REDACTED], could you tell  
8 what you were just describing, whether or not the  
9 patient was moving?

10 A. The patient was moving at that point, yes.

11 Q. Could you describe what kinds of movements?

12 A. It was kind of a jerking, resisting kind of  
13 movement. There's, you know, classic, like, medical  
14 induced movements, things, you know, like seizure  
15 activity, you know, they call it tonoclonic movement.  
16 That is not what this looked like. This looked like  
17 purposeful controlled movement to try to get out of  
18 the situation of having being restrained. That's how  
19 I would kind of describe the movement.

20 Q. Was that patient verbal, saying anything, Mr.  
21 [REDACTED]?

22 A. He was verbal but not really comprehensible  
23 speech. You could hear, you know, kind of, you know,  
24 garbled words of that nature, and/or him trying to say  
25 words, but -- but you could not hear anything.

1 Q. Did you make any other observations about that  
2 patient being restrained?

3 A. He had a spit sock over his head. He was naked,  
4 true to the details of the dispatch note.

5 Q. What was the weather like at that -- at that  
6 time, Mr. [REDACTED]?

7 A. It was cold. I don't know if it was exactly  
8 below freezing, but there was snowfall. When it  
9 landed it melted, it did not stick. So, it was -- it  
10 was relatively cold. He was covered in, you know,  
11 like, moisture. He was damp.

12 Q. Did you observe any blood, Mr. [REDACTED]?

13 A. He had some abrasions over his body spread about.

14 Q. Based on all those observations that you just  
15 made and just described for the Grand Jury, Mr.

16 [REDACTED] including the nudity, the blood, the  
17 incomprehensible speech, the original nature of the  
18 call being psychiatric, did you draw any conclusions  
19 about what was go on with the patient?

20 A. I could draw the conclusion that this man needed  
21 help and that we needed to get him to the hospital.  
22 Without any further information, just objectively, I  
23 don't think I could fully speculate what would be the  
24 issue without having more of a background or kind of  
25 information from others or from the patient himself.

1 Q. Did you perceive any more information from the  
2 officers at the scene about the patient?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What was that, Mr. [REDACTED]

5 A. The officers informed us that this was a man who  
6 was reported missing by his family and that he -- he  
7 ran off earlier and the family reported that he could  
8 have been doing drugs and the drugs could have  
9 included PCP. And then, someone called 911 for a man  
10 that was breaking windows, or something of that  
11 nature, running down -- down the street that we were  
12 dispatched to. And, I guess, that is how the police  
13 officers initially found him, was by responding to  
14 this 911 call.

15 Q. Now, I don't want you to guess, Mr. [REDACTED] let  
16 me ask you this question. Are you familiar with the  
17 effects and symptoms of PCP intoxication?

18 A. I know very generally. I do not know every side  
19 effect, no.

20 Q. Did this patient's presentment, including some of  
21 the things that you just described, is that consistent  
22 with what is known about PCP use?

23 A. I know that it can make people agitated.

24 Q. Did this person appear agitated?

25 A. Yeah.

1 Q. Mr. [REDACTED], did you later learn that that  
2 patient's name was Daniel Prude?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. What is that you do -- based on these  
5 observations, Mr. [REDACTED], what is that you decided to  
6 do as an EMT?

7 A. Regardless of what was going to happen, he needed  
8 to go to the hospital. And -- so, I knew that and I  
9 said well, I don't know the exact steps that we need  
10 to take, but right now I need to be concerned with how  
11 to safely get him into the back of the ambulance to  
12 effectively bring him to the hospital. So, I made the  
13 steps to, you know, get the stretcher, position the  
14 stretcher next to the patient, undo all the straps and  
15 get it ready to then move the patient onto the  
16 stretcher to bring him to the hospital.

17 Q. Did you then do all those things, Mr. [REDACTED]

18 A. Yes.

19 Q. And, while you were doing that, where was  
20 [REDACTED]?

21 A. [REDACTED] was talking to police officers, getting  
22 more of the story. And, after she did that, while I  
23 was pulling the stretcher around, she made the  
24 decision that she was going to sedate him for his  
25 safety as well as our own. Her, you know, protocol is

1 that she had as a Paramedic, she was going to sedate  
2 him. She also wanted to administer a higher level  
3 sedative agent that only the Supervisors carried. So,  
4 as she was drawing up the initial sedative, she called  
5 our Supervisor for a -- possibly giving the higher  
6 level sedative as well. And, that was while I was  
7 pulling the stretcher next to the patient. She was  
8 towards the back of the ambulance actually making the  
9 phone call.

10 Q. Now, while you were getting the stretcher ready I  
11 believe you just testified to, Mr. [REDACTED] were you  
12 next to the patient?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. And. While you were getting the stretcher ready,  
15 were you able to observe the patient?

16 A. I was able to see.

17 Q. Okay. And, at some point while you were getting  
18 the stretcher ready, sir, were you alerted to a change  
19 in the patient's condition?

20 A. Yes. One of the officers had mentioned that it  
21 seemed like he stopped moving as much and that he may  
22 have thrown up.

23 Q. Do you know which officer said that?

24 A. No. It was one of them behind him.

25 Q. And, do you know when they made that statement,

1 the officer made that statement, Mr. [REDACTED], whether  
2 or not the officers were still hands on with Mr.  
3 Prude?

4 A. I believe there was no longer anyone on his head,  
5 but there were people behind him, kind of, you know, I  
6 don't think using as much force as before, but they  
7 were still hands on.

8 Q. Do you know whether or not they were using any  
9 force at all?

10 A. I don't know.

11 Q. Now, Mr. [REDACTED] what did you do when you were  
12 alerted to that change in condition?

13 A. Well, naturally, I check -- as an EMT, you're  
14 taught your ABC's of, you know, anything that's airway  
15 breathing circulation. So, you know, I look at the  
16 patient. I checked for a pulse on the wrist just to  
17 see if there was one, and I couldn't find one. So, I  
18 said to myself, well, he's handcuffed with his hands  
19 behind his back, maybe that's not the best place to  
20 get it. I removed the spit sock. I instructed the  
21 police to roll him over because I noticed at that  
22 point there was little to no movement, if none at all,  
23 in the patient. So, I asked them to roll him over and  
24 I removed the -- the spit sock and noticed that there  
25 wasn't any breathing, noted no chest rise or fall and

1 then I felt for a carotid pulse and he did not have  
2 one.

3 Q. So, initially, Mr. [REDACTED], when you checked the  
4 radio pulse, Mr. Prude was still prone?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. You asked the officers -- it was you who asked  
7 the officers to turn over Mr. Prude?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. They turned him over?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. And, you removed the spit sock?

12 A. Mm-hmm.

13 Q. You checked for a carotid pulse?

14 A. Mm-hmm.

15 Q. Did he have a pulse?

16 A. No.

17 Q. What did you then do?

18 A. I call for [REDACTED]

19 Q. Where was [REDACTED]

20 A. Just to the back of the ambulance.

21 Q. Okay. Then what happened?

22 A. I was very alarmed and I was initially very  
23 shocked because anyone in emergency medicine knows  
24 that one of the scariest positions to be in is to have  
25 a patient who goes into a cardiac arrest with

1 handcuffs behind their back.

2 Q. Why is that, Mr. [REDACTED]

3 A. Any time you place an object or -- or anything  
4 behind someone's back, that will prop them up. For  
5 CPR, to be adequate, it has to be against a hard flat  
6 surface. If you're laying on something like that and  
7 then you're trying to do compressions, you're not  
8 really compressing the heart, but you're compressing  
9 the whole object. And, you're not effectively pumping  
10 the heart. So, doing chest compressions with someone  
11 who's handcuffed behind their back isn't very  
12 effective. That, initially, was what ran through my  
13 head at that moment, was saying to myself was, well,  
14 geeze, I -- I don't -- I don't know what to do and I  
15 called for [REDACTED] and I asked her, do you want me to  
16 do CPR with the handcuffs? She was like, yes, we  
17 don't have any other choice. So, that's what I did.  
18 I did CPR for, you know, a couple rounds as they were  
19 looking for the handcuff key.

20 Q. Did it appear to you, Mr. [REDACTED] that there was  
21 a delay for the key?

22 A. There was. It seemed odd that there were  
23 multiple police officers near us but no one had a  
24 handcuff key and that someone had to go to their  
25 cruiser -- their patrol car to get a key.

1 Q. How many rounds of CPR did you do while Mr. Prude  
2 was handcuffed?

3 A. I did at least two. So, I would say anywhere  
4 around, you know, a couple of minutes, two or three.

5 Q. Eventually, was Mr. Prude un-handcuffed?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. And, placed on the stretcher?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Was the stretcher moved into the ambulance?

10 A. Correct.

11 Q. Did you con -- did you -- let me withdraw that.  
12 Did you continue CPR in the ambulance?

13 A. Yes. We continued CPR, you know, brief pauses  
14 while we moved him onto the stretcher, continued CPR  
15 while we were moving the stretcher towards the back of  
16 the ambulance, briefly stopped CPR again to lift the  
17 stretcher into the ambulance. I then continued CPR  
18 inside the ambulance.

19 Q. At some point, Mr. [REDACTED], were you able to get a  
20 pulse back for Mr. Prude?

21 A. We did.

22 Q. After how long, if you can say, sir?

23 A. I would guess somewhere between 15 and 20 minutes  
24 of our arrival. I'm not exactly sure exactly what  
25 time the cardiac arrest began. But, I would suspect

1 about 15 minutes from our time when we got pulses  
2 back.

3 Q. Could you just briefly describe for the grand  
4 jurors, what happened from there, Mr. [REDACTED], after  
5 you got the pulse back?

6 A. It's pretty straight forward protocol that --  
7 that once we get pulses back, we've stabilized the  
8 patient enough to get them to the hospital quickly to  
9 then have them, you know, perform the high level of  
10 care that the patient needs. So, I always, in any of  
11 our cardiac arrests, as soon as we get pulses back, I  
12 know it's my job to get out of the back of the  
13 ambulance and go drive the ambulance now. So as soon  
14 as I heard we got pulses back, I just knew to open the  
15 door, hop out and get into the front seat.

16 Q. Where did you transport Mr. Prude to?

17 A. To the U of R Hospital, Strong Memorial.

18 Q. And, what was his condition when you got him to  
19 Strong, Mr. [REDACTED] Had it improved at all?

20 A. I would say it was unchanged from the point of  
21 when we got pulses back on scene. It was still that  
22 he had pulses, but he was still, you know,  
23 unconscious, intubated, all of that.

24 Q. Did that -- once you got to Strong, did that end  
25 your care of the patient, Mr. [REDACTED]?

1 A. Yeah. We -- we brought him into the trauma bay,  
2 moved him onto the hospital bed, [REDACTED] gave them a  
3 report, and that's pretty much where our part of the  
4 job ends.

5 Q. Mr. [REDACTED] I just want to go back and ask you a  
6 couple of questions about what you said when you  
7 arrive on scene. Was it just the -- withdraw that.  
8 Was it only the actions of the officer that was near  
9 or at a head of Mr. Prude that you described as sort  
10 of a technique or action that you hadn't seen before?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Did -- did what you were seeing concern you, Mr.

13 [REDACTED]

14 A. It left me questioning, like, because naturally,  
15 I don't know very much about what the police officers  
16 are taught to do and how they're taught to restrain  
17 people. It left me wondering, is that something  
18 they're taught or something of that nature? Did I  
19 immediately say, hey, like, that's not a very great  
20 thing to be doing to someone? Yes. But, I don't -- I  
21 don't know if they were taught to do it or not.

22 Q. And, did you express any concern at the time to  
23 anybody at the scene, Mr. [REDACTED]

24 A. No.

25 MR. SMITH: I have no further questions for

1 Mr. [REDACTED] Do any of the grand jurors have any  
2 questions?

3 MS. SOMMERS: Can I ask a question? I'll  
4 ask you.

5 BY MR. SMITH:

6 Q. I do just have a couple more questions, Mr.  
7 [REDACTED]. I'm wondering about the drive from the scene  
8 of the staging to the scene at 435 Jefferson. And, I  
9 believe, and I don't want to put words in your mouth,  
10 or mis-characterize your testimony, but I believe you  
11 stated that you and [REDACTED], Ms. [REDACTED] have an  
12 understanding, sort of, the difference between the EMT  
13 and a higher level Paramedic, and what she's going to  
14 do and what you're going to do. I guess my question,  
15 based on all of that, Mr. [REDACTED] specifically, is  
16 whether or not during that drive from, again, the  
17 staging area to 435 Jefferson, whether or not you had  
18 any specific conversations with Ms. [REDACTED] based on  
19 the information and the dispatch and the call about  
20 excited delirium?

21 A. About excited delirium, specifically, I do not  
22 believe so. I believe that it probably was mentioned  
23 that he could have been on drugs. But, specifically,  
24 the phrasing of excited delirium, I don't believe was  
25 ever immediately brought up.

1           A JUROR: I actually have a question, two  
2 part question.

3           MR. SMITH: Okay.

4           A JUROR: First of all, has he ever seen any  
5 of the actual training videos from the police officers  
6 at the RPD? And, when he started CPR on Daniel, he  
7 didn't question that either. When he was told what to  
8 do, was he concerned about that harming him more  
9 knowing it wasn't right?

10          MR. SMITH: Okay. I can ask those  
11 questions. Sure.

12 BY MR. SMITH:

13 Q. As you've heard, Mr. [REDACTED], one of the grand  
14 juror's first question is whether or not you've ever  
15 had the opportunity or occasion to review the Buffalo  
16 Police Department's --

17          A JUROR: Rochester.

18 Q. -- the Rochester Police Department's training  
19 policies or training videos respective to defensive  
20 tactics?

21 A. No.

22 Q. And then, secondly, Mr. [REDACTED] one of the grand  
23 jurors wanted to know whether or not you had a concern  
24 about performing CPR while Mr. Prude was handcuffed?  
25 And, I guess, I'm going to break that down into a

1 couple of questions and make sure it answers the grand  
2 juror's question. Is it ideal, and I think you  
3 answered this, but is it ideal to do CPR, chest  
4 compressions while someone is handcuffed behind their  
5 back?

6 A. Absolutely not.

7 Q. Is it better than no CPR at all?

8 A. I would assume, yes.

9 Q. Is the concern with the handcuffing behind the  
10 back that it's ineffective or that it could hurt the  
11 person?

12 A. More that it's ineffective.

13 MR. SMITH: Did that answer your question.  
14 Do any of the grand jurors have further questions for  
15 Mr. [REDACTED]?

16 MS. SOMMERS: I have just -- I apologize.  
17 I'm not -- there seems to be kind of, watching the  
18 video, just a -- a lack of sort of, swiftness or  
19 appreciation of the gravity maybe or the potential  
20 gravity of the situation, and I'm just wondering, were  
21 you -- because you mentioned that you were alarmed and  
22 shocked when you arrived on scene, and I'm just  
23 wondering perhaps, why you didn't sort of move a  
24 little bit faster?

25 THE WITNESS: Well, we're taught to handle

1 emergencies by remaining calm. And, if you're not  
2 calm, you're not ever going to be effective. You can  
3 -- and, this is how I would handle things. Is you can  
4 internally say, well, that's alarming, but you have to  
5 remain with a poker face and you have to be able to  
6 address these things. Running around and -- and doing  
7 things of that nature, I don't think will help anyone.  
8 It would most likely increase the, you know, amount of  
9 risk tied with what you're doing and the likelihood of  
10 some sort of adverse outcome associated, you know,  
11 with making a mistake.

12           The gravity of the situation is never lost  
13 with me in these types of situations. It's -- it's  
14 ever apparent that these are people's lives that many  
15 times have been lost and that's why it's such a  
16 pressing event. The gravity of that's never lost on  
17 me. But, would I ever rush or try to move with an  
18 increased haste because of that, no, because I can  
19 trust my training and I know what to do in -- in  
20 situations when -- when I'm presented with them. And,  
21 if I rush, it's only going to be more dangerous for me  
22 and less advantageous to the patient.

23           So, if you thought that I wasn't moving with  
24 regard, I -- I would question that because I think  
25 much of what I do is well thought out and calculated

1 from the beginning. I try to always keep my -- my  
2 hands busy whenever I was an EMT. I always felt that  
3 -- that if I wasn't doing something, most of the time  
4 I felt like I was doing something wrong, but I never  
5 did something, you know, crazy aggressive fast because  
6 of the situation itself. So, yeah.

7 BY MR. SMITH:

8 Q. Mr. [REDACTED], is transporting a 941, mental health  
9 arrest psych patient, an acute medical emergency?

10 A. Well, I think you need a little bit more  
11 information about what that is because a 941 can be  
12 very broad.

13 Q. Let me ask it another way. Prior to the cardiac  
14 arrest, was the scene that you arrived at, did you  
15 perceive that to be an acute medical emergency, Mr.  
16 [REDACTED]?

17 A. A medical emergency, yes. Acute, as in needing  
18 direct interventions, specific to ensure, you know,  
19 life, I would say no.

20 Q. Did that change after Mr. Prude's change in  
21 condition.

22 A. Yes.

23 MR. SMITH: Any further questions?

24 MS. SOMMERS: I have one more.

25 Are you aware, based on your own training

1 and experience, that individuals who are suffering  
2 from or appear to perhaps be suffering from excited  
3 delirium syndrome can rapidly devolve into cardiac  
4 arrest? Were you aware of that back in March?

5 THE WITNESS: I would say I was aware that,  
6 you know, a lot of these psychiatric events that are  
7 tied to -- to drugs can divulge into, you know, some  
8 sort of life threatening event. I was not as well  
9 versed that excited delirium itself could rapidly  
10 change into something like a cardiac arrest.

11 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you.

12 MR. SMITH: [REDACTED] ?

13 A JUROR: I don't know. Was there actually  
14 foam on the stretcher; and, if so, why would be doing  
15 CPR on the foam stretcher different than anything  
16 else.

17 THE WITNESS: You're entirely correct.  
18 There is a mattress on the stretcher and it does  
19 impede our, you know, CPR to some ability. The same  
20 way, a hospital stretcher has a mattress and, in some  
21 way that does impede it. But, to -- if you put your  
22 hands behind your back, you can feel that you're --  
23 you're kind of putting all that pressure on your  
24 shoulder blades and if you press down on your chest,  
25 it will move your chest as itself, so it will move

1 your chest like this, but you want, when you're doing  
2 CPR, to naturally do like this so your back doesn't  
3 move. So, the bigger issue of, it's not a flat, a  
4 firm surface, is a greater issue than, you know, it  
5 being a softer surface, if you understand what I'm  
6 saying.

7 MR. SMITH: Did that answer the question?

8 A JUROR: Yes.

9 MR. SMITH: Do any of the other grand jurors  
10 have any other questions for Mr. [REDACTED] Seeing as  
11 there are none, you are excused. Thank you.

12 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

13 (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
14 room at a time of 2:44 p.m.)

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1 (Discussion off the record.)

2 (Proceeding reconvened.)

3 MR. Smith: Everybody, we're going to call  
4 Sergeant [REDACTED].

5 (Whereupon, the witness entered the Grand  
6 Jury room at a time of 2:47 p.m.)

7

8 **S G T.** [REDACTED] [REDACTED] after being  
9 duly called and sworn, testified as follows:

10

11 **EXAMINATION BY MR. SMITH:**

12 Q. Good afternoon, sir.

13 A. Good afternoon.

14 Q. Could you state and spell your first and last  
15 names for the record, please?

16 A. [REDACTED]

17 Q. How are you employed, Sergeant [REDACTED]?

18 A. As a Sergeant with the City of Rochester Police  
19 Department.

20 Q. And, how long been employed with the Rochester  
21 Police Department?

22 A. 24 years, two months.

23 Q. How long as a Sergeant?

24 A. 12 years.

25 Q. What is your current assignment, sir?

1 A. I'm the Sergeant assigned to the Research and  
2 Evaluation Section.

3 Q. Could you just explain for the grand jurors what  
4 the Research and Evaluation Section does?

5 A. Primarily we deal with departmental policy, some  
6 training and I oversee our New York State Division of  
7 Criminal Justice Services Accreditation Program, along  
8 with a variety of other tasks.

9 Q. Do you have any other roles or duties at the  
10 Rochester Police Department, sir?

11 A. Yes, sir.

12 Q. What are those?

13 A. I'm the Commander of our Hostage Negotiation  
14 Team, Commander of our Crisis Intervention Team and  
15 Commander of our Domestic Abuse Response Team.

16 Q. I want to ask you some questions, Sergeant [REDACTED]  
17 about the Crisis Intervention Team?

18 A. Yes, sir?

19 Q. What is it first of all?

20 A. It is an abbreviated version of the definition of  
21 the team of specially trained officers that  
22 voluntarily participate and the primary purpose is to  
23 respond to calls involving people in crisis based on  
24 primarily mental health, substance abuse or emotional  
25 distress.

1 Q. We'll break that down a little bit. I'm just  
2 wondering if you could explain for the grand jurors,  
3 give them a sense of, briefly, how the CIT Team came  
4 to be in the Rochester Police Department; how it was  
5 formed, when and by whom?

6 A. In 2002, Rochester Police had several in-custody  
7 deaths that were primarily considered to be people  
8 that were in an emotional or mental health crisis.  
9 So, the command at that time formed a fairly large  
10 committee composed of law enforcement, social service  
11 agencies, medical professionals, hospitals, probation,  
12 et cetera, and the court system. They met, they  
13 decided that more training was needed. They based a  
14 lot of their recommendations on something called the  
15 Memphis Model, which is where crisis intervention  
16 began back in the 80's and came up with the concept  
17 for what was then called the Emotion and Disturbed  
18 Person Response Team. That team still exists, we just  
19 changed the name about three years ago to Crisis  
20 Intervention Team.

21 Q. What is the end goal or the purpose of the Crisis  
22 Intervention Team?

23 A. The end goal is to -- for -- ensure the safety of  
24 the members, officers, the public and the, what we  
25 call them, the ED, the emotionally disturbed person

1 that in any incident which resolved safely and  
2 preferably with no harm to anybody involved.

3 Q. How does an officer in the CIT Unit differ -- or  
4 how would they handle an incident than just a regular  
5 patrol officer, sort of, what's the difference in the  
6 training between the outcomes?

7 A. CIT Officer. First, you said the CIT Unit, we do  
8 not have a Unit. At least in the Police Department,  
9 we are not allowed to call it a Unit.

10 Q. Your secret is safe here, sir.

11 A. A Unit would be a full-time assignment. CIT is a  
12 part-time assignment and we do --

13 Q. We'll get to that.

14 A. -- during normal duties. CIT has -- a CIT member  
15 volunteers and then goes through a 40 hour training,  
16 we give then additional tools when dealing with people  
17 in crisis.

18 Q. What are some of those tools?

19 A. One is knowledge to recognize symptoms of a  
20 person in crisis. An example being what symptoms of  
21 someone that might be a schizophrenic might exhibit.  
22 Those are usually verbal, physical and environmental  
23 clues. They are -- they interact with individuals  
24 that have mental health issues. During this school  
25 for family members of those people to give a better

1 idea of what their interactions with law enforcement  
2 have been. We bring in the medical professionals, or  
3 mental health professionals to get more information  
4 about hospital procedures, resources that are  
5 available in the community and we teach de-escalation  
6 or communication tools.

7 Q. What is de-escalation, Sergeant [REDACTED]

8 A. De-escalation is a -- a tool to preferably,  
9 peacefully, resolve an intense situation.

10 Q. What does it involved; what is the tactic or  
11 technique?

12 A. We base it on what is called the FBI behavioral  
13 modification stairway which, in essence, is we try to  
14 build a rapport with the individual. For lack of a  
15 better term, by making small talk. And there are some  
16 things that we teach, questions to ask, things to say,  
17 things not to say, and how to say things. But,  
18 there's also things like, body language, things of  
19 that type that help us to, kind of, form a  
20 relationship with the individual that's in crisis.  
21 But, doing that we -- again, I apologize for saying  
22 this again, for lack of a better term, we are able to  
23 establish control over that person, not physical.  
24 And, to get them to do what we want so that we can  
25 resolve the situation without force.

1 Q. That's the goal?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. I believe you had said some of this stuff,  
4 Sergeant [REDACTED] I'm probably going to be a little  
5 repetitive here, but do members of the CIT Team  
6 receive any specialized training?

7 A. We call it the -- the 40 hour basic course.

8 Q. What are the contents of the 40 hour course,  
9 generally?

10 A. The first day covers diagnoses. So, we go  
11 through in a broad scope, the various mental health  
12 diagnoses; schizophrenia, depressions, personality  
13 disorders, psychosis, things of that nature. And, as  
14 I mentioned before the characteristics to look for  
15 when you're dealing with somebody, they're not taught  
16 to diagnose, they're taught to recognize symptoms.  
17 They're taught a lot on excited delirium, dealing with  
18 veterans, on dealing with juveniles, on dealing with  
19 senior citizens.

20 Q. Is there any specific training on de-escalation,  
21 Sergeant [REDACTED]

22 A. The block -- it's not called de-escalation, it's  
23 called communication skills. But, yes.

24 Q. You mentioned excited delirium?

25 A. Yes, sir.

1 Q. The CIT Team members are given some specialized  
2 training on excited delirium?

3 A. There is one block on it.

4 Q. Tell us what is in the block, Sergeant [REDACTED]?

5 A. It's a half hour to 45 minutes class. It -- it  
6 covers what to look for with someone that potentially  
7 is suffering from excited delirium. The -- the way  
8 they're speaking, obviously, the physical behaviors,  
9 some of the things that the individual might do, and  
10 how to interact with them safely in a nutshell.

11 Q. That's -- that's training extra and above, again,  
12 what's given to them, them being the officers in the  
13 Academy?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. And, again, this specific CIT training in  
16 awareness and identifying psychiatric conditions,  
17 drugs, excited delirium, again, over and above what's  
18 given in the Academy to the recruits?

19 A. Yes, sir.

20 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED] I think it follows then to  
21 receive these trainings, you have to be a member of  
22 the CIT Team?

23 A. Yes, sir.

24 Q. How does one become a member of the CIT Team?

25 A. Our procedure -- I can't speak to other law

1 enforcement agencies. But, our procedure is that I  
2 will, usually once a year, we call it posting, put out  
3 our announcement saying we're going to conduct this  
4 school and anybody that meets some loose criteria,  
5 number of years on the job, internal affairs history,  
6 we call it PSS history, sick time, and Supervisor  
7 recommendations. As long as they meet those things  
8 that I review, and as long as they can be spared  
9 personnel wise from their assigned platoon, they --  
10 they can go to the school.

11 Q. Voluntary?

12 A. Yes, sir.

13 Q. Okay. I just want to ask you about some specific  
14 officers, Sergeant [REDACTED] Is Officer, Rochester  
15 Police Office, [REDACTED] on the CIT Team?

16 A. No, sir.

17 Q. Is Officer [REDACTED] on the CIT Team?

18 A. No, sir.

19 Q. Is Officer [REDACTED] --

20 A. No, sir.

21 Q. -- on the CIT Team.

22 A. No, sir.

23 Q. [REDACTED] ?

24 A. No, sir.

25 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED]

1 A. No, sir.

2 Q. So, is it fair to say that some of that training,  
3 that special training that you had just discussed,  
4 those officers would not have received?

5 A. They have not.

6 Q. I want to ask one more question about the excited  
7 delirium training, Sergeant [REDACTED] Do the CIT Team  
8 members, when they're trained about excited delirium,  
9 received any special training regarding the  
10 vulnerability of people who may be experiencing these  
11 symptoms to certain things, like, positional asphyxia?

12 A. Briefly. Part of it is the medical aspect of it.

13 Q. Sort of, what generally is that training?

14 A. Primarily, that we teach that if someone is  
15 potentially suffering from excited delirium, get  
16 medical treatment as soon as possible, if not,  
17 immediately. It is vital due to the body overheating,  
18 and that can result in cardiac issues.

19 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED] how does the CIT Team get  
20 activated; how is it that a CIT Team member comes to  
21 respond to an incident?

22 A. There's two or three different ways. The primary  
23 way is that we have a general order that covers the  
24 Team, and that general order specifies that and  
25 working with the 911 call Center, that if a person is

1 actively threatening or attempting to commit suicide,  
2 that a CIT Team officer should be dispatched by 911.  
3 But, there are other ways. Someone could call and  
4 request a CIT Team officer. Or, I frequently get  
5 requests from various agencies, mental health  
6 providers and so on, that if a CIT Team officer is  
7 available to go by with one of our facet workers, one  
8 of the FIT Team or any of the other agencies that go  
9 out in the field with them to check on a person, or to  
10 complete their paperwork, which is for a 945 or a 960  
11 mental hygiene detention.

12 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED] do the CIT Team, Crisis  
13 Intervention Team, operate 24 hours a day, 7 days a  
14 week?

15 A. Kind of.

16 Q. Tell me?

17 A. Because it is a voluntary assignment, we cannot  
18 dictate where the officer can work. So, if I trained  
19 an officer that currently works on the first platoon,  
20 our midnight shift, and three months later he  
21 transfers to days, I can't say that he cannot do that.  
22 That's by contract, we're not allowed to do that. So,  
23 in theory, yes, but in practice, we can't guarantee.  
24 And, also, you have to toss in sick time, vacation  
25 time, things like that, where it might take people off

1 their normal shifts.

2 Q. Is it fair to say, Sergeant [REDACTED] that there's  
3 certainly not a question that there could be shifts at  
4 the Rochester Police Department where there is no CIT  
5 Team member on duty?

6 A. Correct.

7 Q. And, do you know, specifically, sir, if you know,  
8 whether or not there was any Crisis Intervention Team  
9 members on duty in the vicinity of 3:00 a.m. to 3:30  
10 a.m. on March 23rd of 2020?

11 A. I never looked.

12 Q. You mentioned the FIT Team, sir?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. And, could you tell the grand jurors what the  
15 Erie County FIT Team is?

16 A. That one I don't know, but I know the Monroe  
17 County one.

18 Q. I just realized the problem. The Monroe County?

19 A. Monroe County FIT Team is a subset of the Monroe  
20 County Office of Mental Health. It consists currently  
21 of five mental health clinicians who work on the road  
22 with law enforcement. They only go to calls or houses  
23 after being requested by law enforcement. They  
24 operate throughout the County. So, what might happen  
25 is, I might go on a call, if I think the person

1 probably needs more services but maybe didn't have to  
2 go to the hospital, I would call the FIT Team, say,  
3 can you come visit this person and do a better  
4 evaluation, as they're a mental health clinician and  
5 I'm am not. And, they can then track that then with  
6 further appointments with a mental health provider or  
7 any of the social services that are out there that we  
8 don't have the capacity to do so.

9 Q. Are you aware, sir, of when the Monroe County FIT  
10 Team operates?

11 A. Yes, sir.

12 Q. When?

13 A. Monday through -- currently, Monday through  
14 Friday from approximately 8:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m.

15 Q. So, with that in mind, do you know whether or not  
16 the FIT Team was available at 3:30 in the morning on  
17 March 23rd, 2020, which was the early morning hours on  
18 a Monday?

19 A. They would not have been.

20 Q. Now, sir, based on all your multiple roles at the  
21 Rochester Police Department, do you also have the  
22 occasion to teach at the Police Academy?

23 A. Yes, sir.

24 Q. And, what sort of subjects do you teach on?

25 A. Obviously, mental health related topics, hostage

1 negotiations topics, communication skills, domestic  
2 violence and officer willingness.

3 Q. And, Sergeant [REDACTED], when you teach the new  
4 recruits about emotional distress and psychiatric  
5 issues, is there any training about excited delirium  
6 during that portion?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. How much?

9 A. One power point slide.

10 Q. Sir, showing you what's been marked as Grand Jury  
11 Exhibit 51, which is a nine page document that's  
12 double sided. I want to ask if you recognize that?

13 A. Yes, sir.

14 Q. What do you recognize that to be?

15 A. This is one lesson from the recruit curriculum.

16 Q. And, is this the lesson that you give to the  
17 recruits at the Police Academy?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. And, is this a curriculum that you created, sir?

20 A. No, sir.

21 Q. Who created that curriculum?

22 A. The Department of Criminal Justice Services.

23 Q. And, this Exhibit again, Grand Jury Number 51,  
24 this is an exact copy of the power point that you give  
25 to the new recruits in the Academy on emotional

1 distress?

2 A. Yes, sir.

3 MR. SMITH: At this time, I'm going to offer  
4 Grand Jury Number 51.

5 (Whereupon, Grand Jury Exhibit Number 51 was  
6 then received into evidence.)

7 BY MR. SMITH:

8 Q. I'm now going to publish for the Grand Jury,  
9 Grand Jury Exhibit Number 51, specifically -- display  
10 specifically, page 4. Direct your attention, sir,  
11 once this is on, and the Grand Jury's attention to  
12 slide number 22, do you recognize what's on the  
13 screen, Sergeant [REDACTED] -- or, can you see it?

14 A. Yes, sir.

15 Q. And, is this the slide that grand -- that the new  
16 recruits get in the Academy as it relates to excited  
17 delirium?

18 A. Yes, sir.

19 Q. And, is this the only training that the recruits  
20 get in the Academy as it relates to excited delirium?

21 A. I go into a little bit greater detail, but it's  
22 not part of the actual curriculum.

23 Q. And, this is the part of the curriculum that you  
24 teach?

25 A. Yes, sir.

1 Q. Can you read what's on the screen on slide 21,  
2 Sergeant [REDACTED]?

3 A. The state of extreme mental and physiological  
4 excitement characterized by extreme agitation,  
5 hypothermia, hostility with exceptional strength and  
6 endurance without fatigue. Many similarities from an  
7 emotionally distressed person. The significant  
8 difference is that they may be under the influence of  
9 an unknown substance or synthetic drug.

10 Q. Is there any indication on that slide, Sergeant  
11 [REDACTED] that individuals experiencing this condition or  
12 these symptoms may be particularly vulnerable to  
13 suffer sudden death or cardiac arrest?

14 A. No.

15 Q. One final question, Sergeant [REDACTED] I understand  
16 that there's training that relates to identification  
17 and awareness and de-escalation that the CIT Team  
18 members get. But, sir, is the goal, even when a CIT  
19 Team member responds or maybe especially to one of  
20 these incidents, is the goal notwithstanding  
21 de-escalation, still to get the individual medical  
22 treatment as soon as possible?

23 A. If necessary, yes, sir.

24 MR. SMITH: I have no further questions for  
25 Sergeant [REDACTED]. Do any of the grand jurors have any

1 questions?

2 A JUROR: Just one. They're trained in  
3 mental health issues, who trains them?

4 THE WITNESS: The New York State Department,  
5 Division of Criminal Justice Services conducts a  
6 trained to trainer that you have to successfully  
7 complete before you can teach pretty much any subject  
8 at the recruit level in the Academy.

9 A JUROR: Trained by a physician?

10 THE WITNESS: DCJS personnel.

11 MR. SMITH: Could you just explain, Sergeant  
12 [REDACTED] for to the grand jurors what DCJS is.

13 THE WITNESS: State agency that oversees law  
14 enforcement training. As to their credentials, I  
15 couldn't tell you. I apologize for that. I know the  
16 curriculum was developed with medical and mental  
17 health professionals, but in terms of the trained to  
18 trainer instructors, that I don't know.

19 BY MR. SMITH:

20 Q. I guess, Sergeant [REDACTED] a follow up would be  
21 regarding, specifically, excited delirium, where did  
22 you learn, sort of, what -- what is it that you teach  
23 to the recruits in the Academy?

24 A. Personal experience.

25 Q. How about in terms of the underlying medical

1 information, sort of, related to excited delirium?

2 A. Between the class, my teaching partner, reading  
3 articles on it.

4 MS. SOMMERS: Do you ever attend training  
5 with or sponsored by the New York Association for  
6 Mental Illness or NAMI or any of those types of  
7 agencies?

8 THE WITNESS: I have been to trainings  
9 across the country. Primary organization is the  
10 Crisis Intervention Team International Organization.  
11 That's an umbrella organization of law enforcement,  
12 mental health professionals and groups like NAMI that  
13 you mentioned. So, it's a conference on a variety of  
14 topics and almost every one that I've attended, I've  
15 sat through a class or a seminar on excited delirium.

16 MS. SOMMERS: Thank you.

17 A JUROR: Why does the block or topic get  
18 added to the CIT training?

19 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry, I couldn't hear  
20 you.

21 A JUROR: Why does the block or topic get  
22 added to the CIT training?

23 THE WITNESS: Primarily, either my  
24 co-teacher or myself decided that it's something  
25 missing from the curriculum. Whether it be because an

1 event that's occurred or that we've researched or  
2 something of that nature.

3 A JUROR: So, excited delirium has come up  
4 in the daily routine of a police officer and is  
5 incorporated into the CIT training, was thought to be  
6 important?

7 THE WITNESS: Primarily, because my  
8 experience with it is why I thought it was important.

9 BY MR. SMITH:

10 Q. Sergeant [REDACTED] what was your experience with it  
11 that you referred to?

12 A. In 2002, I responded to a call with someone who  
13 was later diagnosed or described as suffering from  
14 excited delirium, where the individual died in our  
15 custody.

16 Q. That was the impetus for you to get involved with  
17 this, Sergeant [REDACTED]?

18 A. That, and a -- a family member with extensive  
19 mental health issues.

20 MR. SMITH: Do any of the grand jurors have  
21 any further questions?

22 MS. SOMMERS: To your knowledge, Sergeant  
23 [REDACTED], was the 2002 incident the last one that you are  
24 aware of, where an individual was manifesting symptoms  
25 of excited delirium and died?

1 THE WITNESS: Yes, ma'am.

2 MS. SOMMERS: Is it your understanding that  
3 these incidents are relatively, and by -- I'm -- I'm  
4 air quoting relatively, for the record, rare?

5 THE WITNESS: Extremely.

6 MS. SOMMERS: Okay. But, significant enough  
7 to be taught in CIT training?

8 THE WITNESS: For a variety of reasons, yes.

9 MS. SOMMERS: Is primary among them wanting  
10 to try to do everything to avoid a loss of life or  
11 injuries to everybody involved?

12 THE WITNESS: Yes.

13 MS. SOMMERS: Anybody --

14 MR. SMITH: Do any one of the grand jurors  
15 have any other questions? Seeing as there are none,  
16 you are excused. Thank you.

17 (Whereupon, the witness left the Grand Jury  
18 room at a time of 3:13 p.m.)

19

20

21

22

23

24

25